

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

Commissioners Present:	John Crescimbeni, Chair Curtis Hart, Vice Chair Aaron Glick John Pappas Rhodes Robinson	Public:	Joe Anderson Jeff Lucovsky Leslie Pierpont Tom Larson Anna Dooley
Advisors Present	Sondra Fetner, OGC Richard Leon, COJ Kathleen McGovern, COJ Joel Provenza, COJ	Staff Present:	Cindy Chism

A. Meeting was called to order by Chair at 1:02pm.

1. All present introduced themselves.
2. Speakers' cards were collected and held by Staff.
3. Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes – Motion by Mr. Hart, 2nd by Mr. Pappas. None opposed.
4. Fund Balance Report for 15(F) and 15(N) - (Attachment A)
 - A print out of the available funds listed on the jaxtreemitigation.coj.net was provided. CM Crescimbeni asked if the encumbered funds were listed or if we could get a report on the encumbered funds. Mr. Provenza clarified that the funds listed on the website do not include any encumbered funds or funds earmarked for specific projects. CM Crescimbeni requested a report for each meeting detailing the encumbered funds and thereby providing some status of the progress of the respective projects.
 - Mr. Hart suggested that a line item or report be generated for projects not funded but which are being considered including estimated dollar amounts. Mr. Leon will give a report on pending projects and discuss what's listed and what needs to be added.
 - Total amount available is \$21,148,451.70.

B. New Business

1. Review & Adopt Bylaws (Attachment B)
 - Everyone had read the Bylaws sent by Ms. Fetner. CM Crescimbeni pointed out the Bylaws were replicated out of the ordinance. Ms. Fetner agreed and reminded the group there was one issue still requiring discussion: how to vote, what the majority was; listed on page 4, Section 5, 1.5-102 Quorum and Voting. Presently the way it is written a majority of the members of the commission constitutes a quorum. We must have at least 4 people to conduct a meeting and a majority of those present constitutes an affirmative vote. So a 2 to 2 vote does nothing but a 3 to 1 vote moves the item along. The other option for official actions to be decided would be by a majority vote of those commissioners present and voting. So if anyone had to recuse themselves for any reason that would reduce the actual

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

- total amount to get to that majority. If we had four people here for a quorum and someone had to recuse themselves for a vote that would be 3 members, a 2 to 1 vote could move the item along. The way it is written now, is just Commissioners present. It doesn't take into account anyone recusing themselves, so without the highlighted part, if there are 4 people here, you would need 3 people to pass something. If you include the highlighted part ('and able to vote'), for instance, 5 people here, 2 have to recuse themselves leaving 3 people then 2 would be required to pass it. CM Crescimbeni remarked that for City Council committees 4 votes are required one way or the other. So if someone recuses themselves, you are out of business. Ms. Fetner stated that quorum only impacts the ability to have the meeting and to take official action. It isn't required for the vote to pass. The Commission could require, since you are a small body of Commissioners, in order for anything to pass, there must be 4 affirmative votes.
- CM Crescimbeni pointed out the Council Committee structure requires a quorum of 4 to hold a committee meeting, any item that is taken up by a Committee whether you have a quorum or greater requires 4 votes. If you have a bare quorum of 4 and somebody has to recuse themselves that item is not going to go anywhere. Do most boards and commissions operate that way or does it vary? Ms. Fetner said it varies for most boards she's been on. It is up to this board how they want it to be. CM Crescimbeni asked for comments or suggestions. The way it is written now, we must have a quorum of 4, it would take 3 votes to pass something, if somebody had a conflict and had to abstain, we wouldn't be able to do anything with a bare quorum. At the Council level, there must be 4 votes, sometimes strategy comes into play, when there's only 4 people there you can really screw things up if you want to.
 - Mr. Robinson said he would support having 4 votes since we're meeting every two weeks, nothing will be put off for very long. We shouldn't have very many meetings with only 4 people present. CM Crescimbeni asked if anyone else had any opinions.
 - Ms. Fetner said she would have to add a line which said "requirement of 4 affirmative votes to pass anything" which is not a problem. CM Crescimbeni reminded everyone that 4 negative votes will defeat, it's a two-way street. Ms. Fetner asked if we wanted that added as well. CM Crescimbeni said he believes the way it was written in Council it says 4 votes to move the item, affirmative or negative. Ms. Fetner offered to verify that's how it was written for Council Committees after the meeting.
 - Mr. Glick asked that's not including abstentions? If there are only 4 people here. CM Crescimbeni said that's the problem. Hopefully the abstention would only be for 1 item from the agenda, not for multiple items. If so, we may need to have a conversation. I can't imagine that a conflict will come up that frequently and I certainly can't imagine being conflicted on more than 1 matter before the commission at any single given meeting by the same person.
 - Mr. Pappas pointed out the time change in Section 5, Meetings, 1.5-100. Also page 5, Section 7, Staff Support, 1.7-101; Senior Urban Forester should be changed to Urban Forest Manager. A search and replace should be done for the whole document.
 - Mr. Hart pointed out that scheduling the meeting needs to be revisited due to conflicts. CM Crescimbeni said that would be addressed under new business but asked Ms. Fetner to include whatever time was decided in the revised bylaws.

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

- CM Crescimbeni pointed out on page 7, Section 8, Committees, 1.8-101; you talk about the Chair in the second line and the fourth line it's a little ambiguous. We need to specify that to be Commission Chair. Also, there's a period missing from the last sentence in this paragraph.
- CM Crescimbeni continued, at the bottom under Section 9, Ethics, 1.9-100 (3), when the Commissioner's abstain from voting and fill out the report and give it to the Secretary; who is the Secretary? Ms. Fetner responded that Cindy would collect that. CM Crescimbeni asked if Secretary was Cindy's official title. Ms. Fetner said that the ordinance said staff support. CM Crescimbeni suggested we identify her as secretary on any future agendas. He is concerned about opening the door for any problems. Ms. Fetner said she could change it to read Public Works staff person. She will verify what it says in the ordinance.
- Ms. Fetner asked for clarification from CM Crescimbeni regarding his comments about Section 1.8-101. If the Commission establishes committees, that the Chair is an ex-officio member of that committee. CM Crescimbeni responded, if he established a Committee consisting of Mr. Robinson and Mr. Glick and two members from the audience and appointed Mr. Robinson as the Committee Chair, he's a voting member of the Committee, right? What you were talking about in that paragraph was the Chair of the Commission; it was vague which Chair you were referring to. If the word Commission was inserted before Chair it would clarify the meaning.
- CM Crescimbeni praised Ms. Fetner on the preparation of the bylaws. They were very well done. Any discussion or questions on the bylaws from the audience? Mr. November requested a copy be sent to him. Mr. Hart made a motion to adopt the bylaws with revisions as noted, seconded by Mr. Pappas. Bylaws adopted unanimously.

2. plan-it GEO Presentation – John November, Public Trust (Attachment C)

- An overview of the plan-it GEO tool.
- A Symposium of plan-it GEO with Ian Hanou, founder, at Intuition Ale Works on March 20th.
- CM Crescimbeni asked if once the lydar image has been done, can we update that without taking another lydar image (static image). For instance, if there was a park with no trees on the satellite picture, and we planted 100 trees in it, can we then manipulate the image to show that? Mr. November replied yes, in a way. We cannot change the imagery, i.e., you cannot change that there is 32% canopy cover in District 11. That will stay static throughout the process. But you can show that park in District 11 now has 150 dots of species of trees overlaid on that static image which will give you a visual of what has been done. It is recommended that the assessment is redone every five to ten years so the static imagery stays as fresh as possible for making decisions. We have a lot of good data now, probably enough to keep us busy for a while. Long term it is something the City may want to consider. Or, we may at that point have such a rich inventory that the bottom up has become so rich that we don't need as much of that top down imagery.
- The tool has three tabs which you can use; View, Plan and Grow. The View tab allows you to see the raw data, where the trees are, where they are not; The Plan tab allows you to overlay the socio-economic factors and GIS layers such as storm water corridors, so you can determine where you want trees; The Grow tab allows you to project, based on how many trees you plant, the economic benefit that has to the City long term. This will be very

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

- valuable for grant applications and communicating the value of planting trees long-term with City officials and FDOT.
- For the next three years, the Public Trust is the holder and main manager of the plan-it GEO technology which we've rebranded as jaxdigtrees web tool. Long-term it has not been determined who will house this tool.
 - Mr. Robinson asked if there was an overlay or plans for an overlay which shows existing public lands and conservation lands. Mr. November said, essentially the data is what it is now. What he recommends is merging the existing City GIS data and the data from plan-it GEO and that should give us the information you are looking for. One of the layers on plan-it GEO is land use which tells us where the parks, streets, airports, industrial areas are now using the City's land use designators. There may already be a layer in the City's GIS with this information.
 - Mr. November recommends the memo written by Susan Grandin and Sondra Fetner which breaks down exactly where the trees can be planted and where they shouldn't be planted be made available to all Commission members. Ms. Fetner will get that out to everyone (Attachment D).
 - Mr. November offered to schedule training for the plan-it GEO tool.
 - CM Crescimbeni asked about the different layers, i.e., heat islands, storm water areas, green or no green, if this body wants to move forward with prioritizing project lists, can we create some sort of objective scoring system to evaluate projects. For example, there is an area which is a heat island and maybe they get 3 points but it's a heat island that also has storm water problems it gets 4 points. Is there something we can do with all this information, some type of objective scoring matrix that we can apply to project requests that come through here? Mr. November said that yes the tool will allow that based on what the Commission decides the priorities are i.e. the tool will allow us to select a priority such as storm water or heat islands or Council district, etc. If the Commission sets the weight of storm water heavier for this year, then the tool will show that. If those priorities change in the future, the tool can be changed. Or we could create a matrix, points based system, the old fashion way. CM Crescimbeni asked Mr. November to think about some type of objective criteria to prioritize the projects for the next meeting.
 - Mr. Pappas pointed out that when we look at an objective way to look at the projects, we should break it down into location and then types of material. Based on storm water it would be different type of plant that would provide better storm water support than another plant. How we bring that all together to create an objective prioritization will be important.
- 3. Report on Pending Tree Projects – Richard Leon, Urban Forester Manager (Attachment E)**
- Mr. Leon said that in the future Kathleen McGovern will give the report. She is the City Arborist and manages all the planting projects as well as administers our contract with Davey Tree.
 - On the report the tree projects listed are in different stages of completion, the top two, Harts Road and Old St. Augustine road, are in progress. For example the Harts Road, Ordinance number 2018-0007, that just passed committee on Tuesday. That project was requested by Council Member for District 7 who wanted date palm trees on Harts Road. We determined we have plenty of date palms that have since come down so we did his planting

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

project and added to it to fill in where others have been removed. The total is shown, there are 13 total.

- When we go through a planting project typically they are requested by Council person. What Ms. McGovern submits to OGC is a breakdown of how many trees and what quantities. On this particular project we're replacing some soil, and had to get rid of some stumps from dead palm trees. There will be a map showing planting locations.
- All expenditures from the Tree Fund have to be listed on the JaxTreeMitigation website. The Commission will have to do this as well, it's part of the lawsuit. We can delegate Ms. McGovern to do that but anytime money gets withdrawn it needs to be entered. The website has a direct link to the current projects. You can also click on the Ordinance number link and go to the Ordinance.
- We have two projects currently in progress; Ordinances 2018-0007 and 2018-0043. Both were at Council member's request. 0043 is to plant trees in the median along Old St. Augustine Road and Bartram Park. You'll see the breakdown on that for \$18,364 with various trees planted and you'll see the locations where we're planting.
- We do have a request for Council District 14 to renovate the medians on King Street. That has not been submitted to OGC yet because we are tweaking some of the ground cover for more appropriate plants.
- There are two others in the works as well. There is no detail because they are pending. For example, District 14 Countywide planting Avondale, 200 trees, that is to replace large Laurel Oaks that came down during Hurricane Irma. The Laurel Oaks were meeting their life span; they are not a long lived tree, especially in urban settings. A lot of them had huge leaders break out of them; it was just their time to go. Ms. McGovern is basically going door to door and talking to people to get "buy in." We don't want people to come home from work one day and there's a new tree in their front yard that they don't want. So she's going door to door saying "we took down the trees, we'd like to plant another one, and here are your choices."
- CM Crescimbeni asked if all these trees being replaced were from storm damage. Mr. Leon qualified that yes, most of them were from storm damage but they wouldn't necessarily replace one if there was overhead utilities or infrastructure conflicts, we won't replace it with a like tree but maybe two smaller trees. CM Crescimbeni asked if these trees were eligible for FEMA reimbursement. Mr. Leon doesn't know if replanting trees is a reimbursable item. These trees didn't meet FEMA criteria for removal but were unacceptable to us when we looked at the hazard rating of the tree knowing its species and where it was in its life cycle.
- CM Crescimbeni asked what we were replacing the Laurel Oaks with. Mr. Leon said we have a lot of live oaks and currently we have emerald ash borer, which an invasive pest is wiping out ash trees. There are other pests which wipe out similar type species what we're trying to do is diversify a little bit. I know residents in Avondale love their Live Oaks, my concern is that one day there might be a species come by that likes the taste of Live Oak and Live Oak doesn't have any defenses for it. We're putting some Live Oaks here and there but we're also looking for other large canopy spreading trees. Such as White Oaks or Red Oaks to try to diversify a little bit but still get the same canopy cover.
- CM Crescimbeni asked if the Kings Street project involved any removal. Mr. Leon said we are doing the removal in-house so that would not be included in the price. That amount

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

- listed is an estimate. We are removing Bradford Pear; they have almost completed their life span. In an ideal urban setting, Bradford Pear will last maybe 15 years. We will replace them with more appropriate species.
- CM Crescimbeni wondered should we adopt a standard in our City that if we are going to do a public planting that the specimen must have a minimum life expectancy. Mr. Leon said we could but then we would be looking at the biological and genetic potential of the tree and then trying to mix that with what's the actual potential in an urban setting. For example Laurel Oaks can live 100-150 years in the wild but put them with infrastructure and trimming them and they get wounds and decay where they'll start breaking down. We could come up with something like that as a Tree Commission; i.e., these are the trees we want to avoid. All across America Bradford Pears were really popular with Landscape Architects about 20 years ago, they were all the rage. Now, the industry is changing and people are going away from them. Council Member Love approached us about replacing them. CM Crescimbeni pointed out that if we're going to spend \$20 million dollars, we want something that's going to be around more than 15 years. Today, they are being replaced with something more appropriate but in two years is there going to be another cute tree that the Landscape Architects want which only lives 10 years. Do we need to adopt some standards that we are going to use mitigation monies for with a minimum life expectancy? Mr. Leon agreed. CM Crescimbeni requested further discussion and recommendations from Mr. Leon on what those standards should be at the next meeting.
 - CM Crescimbeni said that despite what a Bradford Pear cost 15 years ago if a tree only lasts 15 years, it's a waste of money. We're digging them up and throwing them in the landfill and now spending more money to put something in that median. That doesn't sound like prudent planning or fiscal policy. Mr. Robinson reminded the Commission that maintenance is always an issue and a cost. Permanence and sustainability is a major consideration because it's just dollars and cents down the road. The better guidance we have or if we need to make an ordinance we need to make an attempt.
 - Mr. Leon continued, the first 2 listed on Attachment E are the only ones in progress (Harts Road & Old St. Augustine Rd) the other 3 items, King Street (collaboration with CM Love), the Countywide tree planting in Avondale (200 trees) that came down in the last year, and some other requests. There are no quantities for these projects yet because they are all either by request or replacements. This is what's coming.
 - CM Crescimbeni asked if the 2 projects in progress are going to Council Tuesday (2/13) and if funds have been encumbered for them. Mr. Leon replied that 0043 has gone to OGC but not sure if it's gone to committee yet. That's not reflected in our encumbrance amounts that have got to come out of the numbers on the page that we looked at today (Attachment A). Mr. Leon agreed. Mr. Provenza was asked about the encumbrance for these two projects. He said the amounts reflected on the website are what is shown in the general ledger. CM Crescimbeni said, for example, if the Council approves a project in November for \$50,000, and it's not in the ground yet, will it be on the Tree Mitigation page or in the encumbered line item. Mr. Provenza replied it will be in the encumbered line item once it goes through the purchasing process. It will be subtracted from the Tree Mitigation total once the money has been authorized. CM Crescimbeni elaborated on Mr. Provenza statement: so the money goes into an encumbered account waiting for purchase orders to go out for trees. Then we write the vendor a check and those encumbered funds begin to

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

dwindle because we're paying for trees, the hole to be dug, someone to stick the tree in the ground etc. Do we have any encumbered funds at this point because there are no projects here suggesting that we do? These 2 at the top of the list (Harts Rd & Old St. Augustine) have not been funded. One will be approved Tuesday (2/13) night, so that's not reflected on the Tree Mitigation webpage. If we have encumbered amounts we're missing some projects. Mr. Provenza noted that there are \$1.9 Million funds encumbered. He will provide a list to Mr. Leon and the Commission.

- Mr. Leon pointed out that as a result of the lawsuit settlement; we are required to use the JaxTreeMitigation website, which was finalized in November, to detail the fund disbursement. CM Crescimbeni would like a meeting scheduled with Mr. Leon, Mr. Provenza and Ms. McGovern to go into further detail regarding the current encumbered funds.
- Mr. Glick asked about the projects listed as Future; if there was a notion about what they are going to cover? Are those requests from Council people? Ms. McGovern replied that most of them are Council requests but the District 13 planting project was using plan-it GEO on where we needed to go next. Mr. Leon added that during Mr. November's presentation District 13 was the lowest so that's why it was listed as a future project. Also, we worked with SPAR on a previous project removing a lot of rotten trees, so the Springfield/Brooklyn Planting is to replace those where we can, so it's still on the radar. Ms. McGovern will get together with the community when she has time.
- CM Crescimbeni asked Mr. Pappas about FEMA covering the removal of a tree that comes down in CROW or a park. I thought FEMA also covered replacing those trees. In the late 90s or 2000s', Davey was pitching a tree canopy survey, though not as sophisticated as plan-it GEO, they were going to manually go out and put a device to a tree and say that's a 25 inch Live Oak, this is a 14 inch Ash or whatever, and it would plot itself in some sort of map. They were selling that to us because if we had an inventory we could get FEMA replacement if they were damaged. Mr. Pappas responded that he didn't believe they did but he would find out.
- CM Crescimbeni asked Dave McDaniel (Chief, Mowing & Landscape Division) how many Date Palms is the City responsible for and how many does the City maintain? Mr. McDaniel responded that there are approximately 300 Date Palms and we maintain all of them. Date Palms are not native to Florida. We've put these trees into 5 x 5 cut-outs which is big enough for the tree to live but not really large enough for the tree to thrive and grow. For example, the heat island, we've put these trees where it gets extremely hot. Right now we individually remove the dead fronds and the fruiting bodies from the trees, so as not to create such a mess and slipping hazard in the urban setting. We do this annually. We try to catch them right as they sprout. If we don't get the crews started soon enough to trim the Date Palms just as they start putting the fruiting bodies out, there are droppings on the ground. Then the crew that did the trimming has to sweep up all the dates that have fallen. We pay for pruning on an hourly rate but if they don't do that then we've got the same hazard as if we had just left them in the trees. It costs approximately \$100,000 a year to maintain 300 Date Palms which are not native to Florida, they are native to California.
- Mr. McDaniel provided the history of the planting of the Date Palms; what used to be the Downtown Development Authority originally wanted to do themed corridors. They started approximately 1997. Mr. McDaniel started with the City in 1999, so the project was already

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

well underway. Mr. McDaniel and Don Robertson, a Forester for about a year before Mr. McDaniel got here, did try to discourage planting the Date Palms. Ordinarily if there was not a themed corridor, Mr. Leon would not have chosen to replace the Medjool Date Palm but because of the theme it wouldn't look very good if we had all these Date Palms and then we stuck a Crepe Myrtle or Washingtonian Palm in the mix. We have to stay with the theme since it's established. Mr. Robinson asked how the Date Palms dealt with the cold we recently had. Mr. McDaniel replied they weren't affected.

- CM Crescimbeni asked how many do we replace every year? Mr. McDaniel said there have been several that have not been replaced, simply because it wasn't reported and some not replaced because it is not noticeable that any are missing. However, in the case of the Harts Road project, we had a specific request from a Council Member to replace them in a median. Out of the 300, only 1 or 2 have been replaced as a result of specific complaints. CM Crescimbeni pointed out that each Date Palm costs \$4705. Mr. McDaniel agreed that was approximately the cost. We had to pay more because the rest of the trees had grown so we had to purchase a larger tree to match, which is more expensive. The more clear trunk, the higher the price. Mr. McDaniel would discourage the continued planting of those with the theme for Downtown and elsewhere.
- CM Crescimbeni asked if Mr. McDaniel thought we needed to keep the 300 in perpetuity, just keep replacing them. Mr. McDaniel said that in 20 years, if he's only replaced 10, it doesn't appear they are going away. If there was some type of beetle or they get a fungus and they are all going to die then you have to look at a bigger capital cost to go in and replace those trees. There's talk of lethal yellowing by some of the certified Arborists throughout the Counties, which is something that can take these trees out but we haven't seen it here.
- CM Crescimbeni then asked if they were all Live Oak trees would you spend \$100,000 per year to prune them. Mr. McDaniel replied no. We have Live Oak trees all over the Urban Core and here's another way to push right tree, right place. We've trapped all these Live Oaks in 4 x 4 cut-outs downtown. We really don't have to prune them that often because they just aren't growing. But without having to mitigate, I couldn't say, Mr. Leon, go cut down all those around those stop signs or light posts. They grow enough that we have to trim them occasionally. CM Crescimbeni opined that the best Date Palm he'd seen was in front of Havana Jax, they had lights and were plastic, and required no pruning or fertilizer.
- Mr. Pappas reiterated the Right Tree, Right Place is extremely important. When you get the Live Oaks close to the sidewalks, then we have sidewalk problems. So making sure we put the right thing in the right place is critical.
- CM Crescimbeni pointed out that \$100,000 maintenance a year on 300 trees which is \$333 per tree is excessive. If this Commission is going to do planting projects, we need to do projects that aren't going to cost so much every year. It's not even really a maintenance thing, we are just trying to prevent a mess, like an infant without a diaper, which is what these things are. This body has an opportunity to chart a new course for that. Mr. Leon pointed out that we agree that the maintenance cost is very high. However, we are between a rock and hard place. For instance there is 220 Riverside, just over the bridge; all of the rows of these Date Palms were already in existence. So should we go with the theme that's already there or should we change? At \$5000 a tree, should we just go remove them all now, even though they aren't dead? It's really a tough call. When District 7 requested

these trees be planted on Harts Road, we gave them options, but they were adamant what they wanted. So to save on shipping costs, we are having them shipped all at once.

4. Future Meeting Schedule (dates/times)

- Despite the discussion at the last meeting about what day and what time, we selected a time which conflicts with the Planning Commission. Mr. Hart periodically has items come before the Planning Commission and CM Crescimbeni had thought to go to the Planning Commission today, so we need to revisit our meeting schedule or we may not be able to keep Mr. Hart on the Commission. Mr. Hart said it only conflicts about six times a year. They are following the Council cycle so when there is a fifth week that throws everything off. Mr. Hart suggested we move the meeting to 1200 on the conflict days, and suggested possibly anyone who has an item on the agenda requested it be moved to the end of the Planning Commission. We would be done at the Tree Commission by 1:30 and the first 15 minutes of Planning Commission is administrative, just a suggestion. CM Crescimbeni believes, we should stay consistent so we'll change all the meeting times. Mr. Pappas made a motion to change the time to noon, seconded by Mr. Glick. We'll try it, if it doesn't work, we can revisit. Motion passed unanimously.

C. Public Comment

Mr. John November, 536 South St, representing Public Trust. One comment, I'd like to see the Tree Commission website. I was looking for the minutes and agenda and they weren't there. Ms. Chism said they haven't been posted yet. Mr. November continued there is the COJ Tree Mitigation.net page, I'd like to see if ITD could make that page have a little more information like a box about the Tree Commission and some of the stuff that the Urban Forestry Dept. is looking for. Just for transparency sake, since we already have this functioning site, if we could use it instead of re-creating the wheel. Ms. Chism said that required more investigation with ITD. The Tree Mitigation website was preferred but there was also the Mayor's page for Boards & Commissions. The Tree Commission has a page there but it isn't very visually appealing. Mr. Pappas asked if there was a requirement for the minutes to be published on a specific website. If you placed them there and then put a link on the Tree site? Do all the Boards and Commissions have to be in the same location? Ms. Chism will follow-up with CM Crescimbeni and Ms. Fetner to determine where to publish the minutes etc.

Mr. Joseph Anderson, 694 Bellshire Dr, JEA. I just came from the Florida Urban Forestry Conference in Tampa. What it was about was storm preparation and natural disaster preparation and response. One common theme throughout with every presentation was how important that tree inventory will be especially when you allocating resources toward response when you have resources coming from the outside to help us recover. You will find that the resource that John was talking about will become very important. I also want to bring your attention to what happened in the awards committee at the Florida Urban Forestry Council; Jacksonville walked away with three awards:

- ✓ Outstanding Urban Tree Project, which happens to be the Greening of the Arc, which was a Greenscape project, Anna is here. She actually won that award for 2017.

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

- ✓ Outstanding Tree Professional, who was Tim Shaw, the manager of Southern Tree Farm on the Northside. For the things that he did to adapt to the needs of the City when planting on a three year average 750 trees per year.
- ✓ Outstanding Tree Advocacy Group, which is Larry Figart of the Duval County Cooperative Extension for his Stewards of Jacksonville Project.

Out of six awards, Jacksonville walked away with three of them. I just thought the Commission should know. If you're interested in learning about the Florida Urban Forestry Council I brought their newsletter (Attachment F). I recommend you get familiar with their awards programs because a lot of the projects you will be handling will be eligible for the State awards and recognition.

Anna Dooley, 1468 Hendricks Ave, Greenscape of Jacksonville, Award Winner. I want to keep you all apprised that Greenscape is busy planting trees. Over the next five weeks we have approximately 300 trees going into the ground with volunteer plantings. Anytime you want to participate in a volunteer planting, please let me know, we do them frequently. Also, our major fund raiser is coming up, you are all invited to the Root Ball on St. Patrick's day at the Zoo (Attachment G). Best of all, March 24th is Jacksonville's official Arbor Day, by Mayoral proclamation. We do this every year. In the past we've had a tree sale, now we're doing a tree give away, a festival with educational opportunities, family events, and a petting zoo, all at the fairground. It is important to know when your official Arbor Day is. I wanted to make sure you were aware of that. CM Crescimbeni asked if Greenscape does City projects; are any of the 300 trees you are getting ready to plant a City project? Ms. Dooley responded it isn't a City project. These trees will be planted at various sites such as the National cemetery, a couple of schools and parks. We make sure maintenance is in place before we do the planting so we are pretty good stewards of our trees.

Tom Larson, 887 Marshside Ct, Sierra Club & Public Trust. I really appreciate the time and attention you are giving to these prospects and really want us to respect that we have a rich history behind us with Greenscape having planted some 300,000 trees to date, over the last 40 years. What we're hoping is this fund that you are the stewards of and guides for can be planted as soon as possible. In my mind I have created a challenge that over the next five years we get all of this 20 million dollars in the ground because there is more money coming in all the time as new development projects go on. So the inbound money keeps coming we need to keep getting thousands of trees planted. To that end, there are groups around the community that would be delighted to get projects in their area. You saw on the list a prospect for Riverside, Avondale area. RAP is interested in getting a group of folks there organized to collaborate with you and Greenscape and JEA and whoever else that can bring resources and guidance to this interest, whether it's on the Northside or some business district of three blocks where people want to help get trees in the ground, Murray Hill, northwest Jacksonville, etc., these community groups are probably going to be wondering how do I tap the City's fund or develop a project. This tool will help them plan their idea and then the City staff, with your guidance, will be able to help shepherd their ideas into a form where you can prioritize them. I think John (November) has prepared a draft outline for how to evaluate projects, how to collect the information and then to help the staff and other community groups to foster them. I hope at your next meeting this can be one of the items for discussion.

Leslie Pierpont, 4157 Ortega Blvd, Late Bloomers Garden Club. I just wanted to echo what Mr. McDaniel said about Date Palms. They are messy, they get a fungus, they are hard to grow, they are

Jacksonville Tree Commission
Meeting Minutes February 8, 2018
Approved on February 22, 2018

native to California and Iraq. I think rather than themed trees, I'd rather see native trees which identify the place. So when they come down, put a native tree in there. I don't think people would object if you have palm, palm, native tree, native tree, palm. I would rather see us focus on identity of place, what Jacksonville is known for rather than things like those expensive Date Palms. As I remember, we spent closer to \$10,000 per tree when we put them in how ever long ago that was. CM Crescimbeni remarked that \$20 million will get you 4250. Mr. Hart corrected, actually 4371 if you want to spend the whole 20 million.

D. Information

Ms. Fetner updated the Commission on the tree bills which were in Tallahassee. There were two companion tree bills, one in the House and one in the Senate, which would preempt local governments from establishing tree protection regulations and mitigation requirements. Those bills have drastically changed since our last meeting. In fact there is no longer a preemption for that purpose. Now the only bill standing at this time, which is House bill 521, is only a preemption for the State special districts, water management districts, neighborhood improvement districts, and community development districts, as they're defined in the statute, to remove vegetative debris for flood mitigation purposes and the maintenance of right of way. That's the only time a government cannot regulate the removal of trees. The Senate bill was supposed to be taken in to Committee last week and it was not taken up. It still has three more Committee stops which likely means it's going to die because there is only one week left of Committee in Tallahassee. That's where they are now, much different, less harmful bills than we had anticipated at the last meeting.

CM Crescimbeni listed the action items:

- Everyone will watch the plan-it GEO video before the next meeting, which is February 22, at noon.
- Ms. Chism will circulate the Susan Grandin memo.
- Mr. Leon will discuss life expectancy and whether that's good or bad and what your recommendation might be.
- Mr. November will come back and talk to us about marrying up those layers with some sort of objective criteria process and if you want to also talk about the proposed outline Mr. Larson mentioned as well. Ms. Fetner has looked over the outline Mr. November had created and has been working with Mr. Leon, Ms. McGovern and Mr. November on coming up with a process for people to apply for use of the funds. Ms. Fetner will provide an update at the next meeting.
- Mr. Pappas will follow up regarding the FEMA reimbursement for replacement planting.
- Ms. Fetner, Ms. Chism and CM Crescimbeni will work on finding a home for the Tree Commission documents.
- Final Bylaws adopted today will be signed by the next meeting.

E. Adjournment