



OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL CITY OF JACKSONVILLE

REPORT OF INVESTIGATION CASE NUMBER: 2016-0006WB

ISSUE DATE: SEPTEMBER 28, 2016

Steven E. Rohan
Interim Inspector General

"Enhancing Public Trust in Government"

POSITION QUALIFICATIONS – MISREPRESENTATION OF EDUCATION CREDENTIALS SYSTEMATIC FAILURE TO VERIFY CANDIDATE REPRESENTATIONS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Office of Inspector General (OIG) received a complaint on April 7, 2016, which alleged that several City of Jacksonville (COJ) employees had submitted college degrees and/or transcripts from non-accredited institutions to COJ Employee Services (Employee Services) in support of promotional opportunities. The complainant identified one of these COJ employees as Jamie Hash (Hash), Environmental Program Specialist, Environmental Quality Division, Neighborhoods Department. The complainant was designated as a Whistle-blower based on the information provided. This designation preserves, pursuant to Florida Statute (F.S.) §112.3188, the confidentiality of the complainant's identity.

On April 7, 2016, pursuant to COJ Ordinance §602.303 (j), the matter was referred to the Office of the State Attorney (SAO) due to allegations of violations relating to Florida Statutes 838.022, Official Misconduct. The SAO immediately referred the matter back to OIG for administrative investigation.

The OIG investigation determined that Hash indicated on her application for the Environmental Scientist Supervisor (#2016-01822) position that she possessed a bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university. Hash relied upon her Wilmington National University (WNU) diploma and transcript as proof of meeting this requirement. The investigation determined through Hash's own testimony that she did not attend WNU from 2009 to 2012 as noted on her WNU transcripts, but rather enrolled and took courses through email for a few months in 2012. Additionally, per a review of the United States Department of Education (USDOE) website it was determined that WNU was not currently accredited nor had it ever been accredited by any higher education accreditation body recognized by the USDOE.

The allegation that Hash misrepresented her education credentials was *substantiated*. Of note, during the course of this investigation COJ Employee Services placed this promotional opportunity on hold.

The OIG investigation also disclosed that a lack of internal controls existed within Employee Services, specifically (1) the lack of verification of college degrees and transcripts; and (2) the lack of verification of the educational institutions related to degrees and transcripts submitted to

ensure that those institutions were recognized by the U.S. Department of Education (USDOE). As a result of the lack of internal controls, several COJ applicants have obtained positions and/or been promoted to positions for which they did not meet the required educational qualifications.

During the course of the investigation the Administration took immediate action to correct the lack of internal controls, which will be outlined in the Management Comment and Corrective Action section of this Report of Investigation.

INVESTIGATIVE REPORT

ALLEGATION

Jamie Hash, Environmental Specialist, Environmental Quality Division (EQD), Neighborhoods Department (Neighborhoods), misrepresented her educational credentials to COJ Employee Services.

GOVERNING DIRECTIVES

- Florida Statute § 838.022 Official Misconduct;
- COJ Civil Service and Personnel Rules and Regulations (CS Rules), 4.02 Application,(3) Qualification of Applicants (a);
- CS Rules, Definitions, “accredited institution”; and
- CS Rules, Section 9.05, Reduction in Compensation, Demotions, Suspensions without Pay and Dismissals for cause including conduct unbecoming a public employee and willful falsification of records (false statements, misrepresentation or fraud of official documents, such as application...)

INVESTIGATIVE FINDINGS

Records Review

A review of the Civil Service job specifications for the Environmental Scientist Supervisor (revised in February 2016) reflected that the open requirements/supplemental information required applicants to have at least a Bachelor’s degree. However, it was **not** explicitly stated in the job specification that the Bachelor’s degree was to be from an accredited institution.

The OIG reviewed the COJ Applications, submitted by Hash on two separate occasions for an Environmental Scientist Supervisor position (#2015-01379 and #2016-01822). Per a review of the applications, Hash noted that she graduated from Wilmington National University (WNU) with a Bachelor’s degree in Environmental Science. In both applications, Hash reported that she attended WNU from March 2009 to December 2012. A review of Hash’s supplemental questions incorporated with COJ Application #2016-01822 disclosed that Hash replied “Yes” to supplemental question #8 which read, “Do you have a bachelor’s degree or higher from an accredited college or university? If yes, you will be required to provide a copy of your college transcripts at some point during the selection process.”

A review of Hash's WNU transcript disclosed the following pertinent information:

- Hash received a Bachelor of Science with a concentration in Environmental Science
- Hash received 125 credits
- Dates of attendance reflected March 2009 through December 2012

Per the COJ Civil Service and Personnel Rules and Regulations (CS Rules), Section 4.02, Application, (3) Qualification of Applicants, (a), applicants must:

furnish accepted evidence of meeting requirements (i.e., copies of college transcripts from an accredited institution, certificates, diploma, etc.) upon application for each position, unless an extension is granted by the Head of Human Resources. An employment application must be signed by the applicant and the truth of all statements contained therein shall be certified by the applicant's signature.

Per the CS Rules, Definitions, an "accredited institution" is defined as "An institution of higher learning accredited by an accrediting agency or state approval agency recognized by the U.S. Secretary of Education or as may be approved by the Head of Human Resources."

An OIG review of United States Department of Education (USDOE) website disclosed that WNU was not accredited nor had it ever been accredited by any higher education accreditation body recognized by USDOE. Further, as of April 12, 2016, per a review of the WNU website, under the Terms of Use, it stated that "I understand that any courses, credits, or degrees awarded by the School are not accredited by an accreditor that is approved by the US Department of Education..."

Testimony

Statement of Amy Maddox, former Clerical Service Aide III, EQD, Neighborhoods

Maddox advised that in 2012 she began working at EQD. She then became personal friends with Hash. Maddox said that about six to eight months after Maddox began working in EQD, she was at Hash's residence. She reported that during this occasion, Hash told her that she (Hash) had bought a college degree and transcript on-line for \$400.00. Maddox could not recall the degree type or the name of the school. According to Maddox, Hash offered to show Maddox how to purchase a "fake" college degree if Maddox obtained \$400.00. Maddox did not pursue this action nor did she ever purchase a fraudulent college degree.

Statement of Melissa Long, Chief, EQD, Neighborhoods

Long stated that on March 1 or March 2, 2016, she met with both Jessica Siefert (Siefert), Human Resources (HR) Business Partner and Tina Miller (Miller), HR Specialist, Talent Management, Employee Services, COJ regarding Hash having a college degree from a non-accredited institution. Long said that Miller advised that she (Miller) had confirmed that Hash received a college degree from a non-accredited institution. Long reported that after leaving Miller's office, she (Long) told Siefert that she (Long) would "leave this in Employee Service's hands." In Long's opinion any falsehoods on Hash's applications to COJ could affect EQD enforcement efforts.

Statement of Tracey Bolton, Manager of Personnel Services, Talent Management, Employee Services

Bolton advised that she learned about Hash having a college degree from a non-accredited institution possibly sometime in March or April 2016 but she did not recall how she learned this information. Bolton indicated that she advised her supervisor, Diane Moser (Moser), Chief, Talent Management, Employee Services, about Hash having a college degree from a non-accredited institution shortly thereafter.

Note: Bolton was shown an email dated March 3, 2016 sent to her by Siefert in which Siefert alerted Bolton about Hash having college degrees from a non-accredited institutions. (Bolton did not recall this particular e-mail.) However, e-mails obtained during the investigation revealed that Bolton forwarded the aforementioned March 3, 2016 e-mail (from Siefert) to Moser later that same day (March 3, 2016), asking to discuss this matter with Moser.

Statement of Diane Moser, Chief, Talent Management, Employee Services

Moser believed that Bolton possibly relayed that Hash had a college degree from a non-accredited institution sometime in February 2016. She recalled that approximately one or two weeks after Bolton notified her; she had a conversation with Long about another EQD employee having a college degree from a non-accredited institution. Moser believed that Hash was discussed during this conversation but she could not recall for sure. Moser claimed that Long did not want to go through the discipline process regarding the other EQD employee.

Moser reported that she did not notify Kelli O'Leary, Director, Employee Services, COJ about Hash as she (Moser) thought the issue about her and another EQD employee having college degrees from a non-accredited institution had been resolved during this conversation with Long.

Statement of Kelli O'Leary, Director, Employee Services

O'Leary advised that on April 12, 2016, she contacted Moser in regards to Hash. Upon contacting Moser, O'Leary discovered Moser was already aware of this issue. According to O'Leary, prior to April 12, 2016, no Employee Services employee(s) had notified her regarding the college degree issue involving Hash. O'Leary opined that if Hash's COJ application contained inaccurate dates of attendance (while attending college classes) the information in the application would be a falsification of records. O'Leary explained that as part of the application process, employees certified that each submitted application was true and accurate prior to submission.

O'Leary stated that the COJ adheres to the CS Rules definition of an accredited institution, "as an institution of higher learning accredited by an accrediting agency or state approval agency recognized by the USDOE..." She also stated that COJ employees should submit to Employee Services college degrees from accredited institutions recognized by USDOE. Based upon O'Leary's understanding of the CS Rules, the Head of HR/Employee Services had the discretion to accept and approve a non-accredited degree for a job specification. However, as Director of Employee Services, she had never deviated from the CS Rules' definition.

O'Leary believed COJ job specifications should contain clear verbiage that only college degrees from accredited institutions would be accepted. This would allow employees to be unequivocally aware of expectations and would protect the COJ.

Statement of Christopher "Blane" Johnson, Environmental Program Supervisor, EQD, Neighborhoods

Johnson stated that he was unaware if Hash purchased any degrees on-line. Johnson advised that he knew Hash had a college degree but was unaware of any further details.

Statement of Jamie Hash, Environmental Specialist, EQD, Neighborhoods

According to Hash, she completed three or four on-line college courses from 2005 to 2006 through Columbia (could not recall full name of institution). She said that she obtained her Bachelor's degree in either Environmental Science or Environmental Studies in December 2012 from WNU after attending courses for two to three months in 2012.

Hash stated that she learned about WNU from a family member in April 2012, which the family member claimed was a nationally accredited institution. Hash stated that she did not research WNU any further other than reviewing WNU's website. Hash said that she was looking for a college degree that she could earn quickly and on-line because she "[did not] have time to sit in class."

Hash admitted the WNU transcript was not accurate as it reflected she completed various courses beginning in 2009 through 2012. She said that she listed her dates of attendance on her COJ applications based upon the WNU transcript. Hash claimed that she did not question these dates, but thought it could possibly be from either classes transferred from Columbia or the credits she received for her life experience.

She said that she personally paid from \$2,000 to \$2,500 to WNU for her studies. Hash stated that she tested out of several classes and received course credits for her life experience. Hash advised that her course load consisted of two to three courses at a time which she completed through e-mails.

Hash denied falsifying applications for COJ Applications # 2015-01379 and 2016-01822 because she believed WNU was accredited. She also denied that she knowingly misrepresented her educational credentials to COJ. Hash believed that her college degree was a "step above" those individuals who only purchased fraudulent college degrees as she put in more effort and money to receive her degree. Although, Hash conceded that she knew her degree was not "as good as a degree as most people work for ..."

Note: OIG provided Hash the opportunity to provide documentation to substantiate the claims made during the OIG interview. No relevant records have been provided by Hash.

CONCLUSIONS

A review of the Civil Service job specifications for the Environmental Scientist Supervisor positions (#2015-01379 and #2016-01822) reflected that the open requirements/supplemental information required applicants to have at least a Bachelor's degree. However, neither one of these job specifications explicitly stated that the Bachelor's degree was to be awarded from an accredited institution.

The Environmental Scientist Supervisor (#2016-01822) position supplemental question #8 read, "Do you have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university? If yes, you will be required to provide a copy of your college transcripts at some point during the selection process." Hash answered "yes" to this question and relied upon her WNU diploma and transcript as proof of meeting this requirement. A review of the USDOE website revealed that WNU was not an accredited institution nor had it ever been accredited by any higher education accreditation body recognized by the USDOE.

Hash testified that she attended several courses over a two to three month period during 2012, and admitted that she did not take courses over a period of three and one-half years (March 2009 through December 2012) as reflected on the WNU transcript.

Based on testimony and records, Hash misrepresented her educational qualifications by asserting during the application process for the Environmental Scientist Supervisor (#2016-01822) position that she had obtained a degree from an accredited institution and that she had enrolled in courses (as reflected on her transcript) spanning over three and one-half years to earn a Bachelor's degree. As such, the allegation that Hash misrepresented her educational credentials to COJ Employee Services was *substantiated*.

The OIG investigation also disclosed that a lack of internal controls existed within Employee Services, specifically (1) the lack of verification of college degrees and transcripts; and (2) the lack of verification of the educational institutions related to degrees and transcripts submitted to ensure that those institutions were recognized by the USDOE. As a result of the lack of internal controls, several COJ applicants have obtained positions and/or been promoted to positions for which they did not meet the required educational qualifications. During the course of the investigation the Administration took immediate corrective action relating to the lack of internal controls, and will be outlined in the Management Comment and Corrective Action section.

RECOMMENDED CORRECTIVE ACTIONS

During the course of this investigation a lack of internal controls were identified. The OIG recognizes that the Administration took immediate action to rectify the lack of internal controls.

The OIG recommends that corrective actions include the following:

1. Review, verify, and update all citywide position descriptions that require a college degree to ensure that the verbiage as specified in the Civil Service and Personnel Rules and Regulations (CS Rules) definition of "accredited institution" is included in all job

descriptions to ensure consistency and uniformity. Provide a comprehensive list of all updated position descriptions. This recommendation should also extend to all future job announcements if a college degree is required.

2. Review and update that the verbiage as specified in the CS Rules definition of “accredited institution” is included in all Ordinances related to all positions were applicable to ensure consistency and uniformity.
3. Develop written policies and procedures regarding the verification process of all educational credentials (i.e. college degrees, professional licenses and certifications) for all citywide positions for both internal and external COJ applicants. Consider incorporating an education verification checklist that adheres to the State of Florida document retention guidelines for both employees and applicants.
4. Consider using a third party vendor to verify that college degrees are from accredited institutions, for both internal and external applicants.

In addition, OIG requests that the Administration advise if any personnel action(s) (including all outcomes) are taken as a result of this investigation.

IDENTIFIED, QUESTIONED, AND AVOIDABLE COSTS

Identified Costs: N/A

Questioned Costs: N/A

Avoidable Costs: N/A

HASH'S RESPONSE

On August 25, 2016, the OIG hand delivered a copy of the draft Report of Investigation to Hash who was provided the opportunity to submit a written explanation or rebuttal to the findings as stated in this Report of Investigation within ten (10) calendar days. On September 6, 2016, a written response was received via email from Hash and is attached in its entirety to this report.

In her response, Hash offered that Wilmington National University (WNU) advertised itself as being “a reputable and accredited university” and stated that she did not have the resources or knowledge required to verify this information; that she relied upon Employee Services to review her educational records, and stated that it was never her intention to misrepresent her educational credentials to the City.

The response was reviewed and considered but did not provide any information that would change the OIG’s findings, conclusions, or recommendations. As of April 12, 2016, per a review of the WNU website, under the Terms of Use, it stated that “I understand that any courses, credits, or degrees awarded by the School are not accredited by an accreditor that is approved by the US Department of Education...” Additionally, during the investigation Hash testified under oath that she only attended courses through WNU for two to three months in 2012, and not the time frames reflected on her WNU transcript.

MANAGEMENT COMMENTS AND CORRECTIVE ACTION

On August 25, 2016, the Chief Administrative Officer, Office of Mayor Lenny Curry, City of Jacksonville, FL was provided the opportunity to submit a written explanation or rebuttal to the findings as stated in this Report of Investigation within twenty (20) calendar days, due on or before September 14, 2016. The Administration subsequently requested and was granted an extension with a response then due on September 21, 2016. On September 21, 2016, a written response was received from the Office of Mayor Lenny Curry and is attached in its entirety to this report.

As a result of this investigation, the Office of Mayor Lenny Curry implemented various corrective actions per their attached response. Of significance, the Administration is adding the word "accredited" to all appointed employee job specifications requiring a degree and is working with the respective unions concerning adding this language to Civil Service job specifications. Additionally, the City is now using a clearinghouse to verify accredited schools and to confirm that the applicants/employees have attended and/or graduate proffered colleges and universities. Further, the City has also updated and/or revised policies and procedures relating to the verification of educational credentials, professional licenses and certificates required for City positions. The City also identified the ordinances which lack the verbiage "accredited institution" for those that identify qualifications requiring college degrees.

Respectfully Submitted,



Steven E. Rohan
Interim Inspector General
September 28, 2016

Attachments:

J. Hash's Response, dated September 6, 2016

Management's Response, dated September 21, 2016, (with accompanying attachments)

cc: IG Distribution A

This investigation has been conducted in accordance with the ASSOCIATION OF INSPECTORS GENERAL Principles & Quality Standards for Investigations.

[REDACTED]

September 6, 2016

Director of Investigations
Office of Inspector General
P.O. Box 43586
Jacksonville, FL 32203

Via E-mail – InspectorGeneral@coj.net

RE: DRAFT Report of Investigation
Case Number 2016-0006WB

This letter is in response to the DRAFT Report of Investigation substantiating misrepresentation of educational credits. First I would like to say it was never my intent to fraud or deceive anyone and especially the City of Jacksonville.

There are several items contained within the DRAFT that I would like to individually address. Page one of the DRAFT, paragraph three, states that I (Hash) indicated on my application for the Environmental Program Supervisor, etc..... I have NEVER applied for the position of Environmental Program Supervisor.

Also on page one of the DRAFT, paragraph three it states that through my (Hash) own testimony that I did not attend WNU from 2009 to 2012 as noted on transcripts. This is a true statement. In my defense, I also stated that perhaps the college back-dated time just a COJ does. If anyone were to ask Employee Services when I started working with COJ, they would be told September 1, 2000. That is my official start date, yet I did not work a single day in 2000, 2001, 2002, 2003, 2004, 2005 and most of 2006. My time was connected and I was under the impression that was what the college had done.

Still on page one, paragraph three it states that it was determined that WNU was not currently accredited nor had it ever been accredited by any higher education accreditation body recognized by the USDOE. I am attaching a print out from WNU's website that states WNU is a reputable and accredited university. I did not have the resources or knowledge required to verify this information and just accepted what was on their website.

On page two, paragraph one is states that OIG disclosed a lack of internal controls existed within Employee Services, specifically the lack of verification of degrees. I turned in my degree and transcripts in early 2013. I was under the assumption that Employee Services would either accept or deny same. Employee Services had over three years (from the time I turned in my degree until I applied for ESS position) to deny my degree if they felt it was not properly accredited. That was never done.

On page four, under TESTIMONY – Statement by Amy Maddox. I want to refute her entire statement. Amy and I were not personal friends; we were friendly at work and Amy's husband Coy did some work for me at my home. Amy was there a few times, but at no time did I ever show her my degree and instruct her on how to get her own "fake" degree. Up until about April of this year, I kept my degree and

transcripts in a folder in my desk drawer in my office, at work. There is no way I showed Amy my degree in my house during the period of time she stated.

Amy was moved out of the Air Activity and any friendship that might have been moved with her. Shortly after her move to another Activity, Amy felt she was caught in the middle of an argument I was having with Tree Kilbourn (enforcement) who was interfering with every aspect of my Activity and she (Kilbourn) could not remain professional and had to attack me personally. It was at that time, (which was in March) I feel like Amy got mad at me because of her job being changed and it is my belief that this entire issue was put in motion because of Amy Maddox and Tree Kilbourn, but as you are aware the complainant was designated as a whistleblower so I will never know for sure who started all this.

The next paragraph, statement of Melissa Long, it states, In Long's opinion any falsehoods on Hash's applications to COJ could affect EQD enforcement efforts. In my job as Environment Specialist, I refer cases to enforcement quite a bit. An Environmental Specialist position DOES NOT require a degree and there has never been any issue with enforcement actions. Long's statement that it could affect enforcement efforts sounds as if it was planted there by Kilbourn.

Beginning on page six is my statement, which I stand by.

It was never my intention to misrepresent myself to COJ. I did work for and received a degree that I thought was accredited. The fact that it was never denied by Employee Services led me to think they had checked it out and accepted it.

I was only trying to promote to get the title and pay for the job I have been doing for quite some time now. Prior to Steve Pace's retirement, I reported directly to him and he was the Sr. Environment Engineer Manager for Air Quality Branch. Every other Specialist in EQD has a Scientist or Environment Program Supervisor to report to. I did not. I reported directly to the Sr. Branch Manager. I have never shied away from the responsibilities required by being the Specialist over Air Response Activity and have always received exemplary performance reviews. Currently, I feel that I am left to completely handle all aspects of the Activity without any immediate supervision.

Sincerely,
Jamie B. Hash

WILMINGTON NATIONAL UNIVERSITY

- [Home](#)
- [About](#)
- [Academics](#)
- [Admissions](#)
- [FAQs](#)
- [Accreditation](#)
- [myWNU](#)
- [Contact Us](#)

Accreditation

Research @ WNU

WNU's Library

The Online Library Collections includes more than one million items, with volumes of print material and thousands of items in extensive holdings of microforms, maps, images, musical scores, sound recordings, and videotapes.

Workshops on library resources or personal consultations on research projects can be arranged by the registrar.

International Students

40% of the University enrolled population are international students. With so many programs in undergraduate and graduate studies, we attract students the world over.

Wilmington National University provides services to meet the special needs of students abroad. We have many support programs to help you fill your personal and academic goals. Wilmington National University can assist you in evaluation and help you choose the degree program that's right for you.

About Wilmington National University



Wilmington National University (WNU) is a comprehensive and interactive university dedicated to the pursuit of excellence in higher education. WNU supports a student centered learning environment that nurtures the development of the whole student for rewarding careers, lifelong learning and fulfilling lives in a global society. It maintains a commitment to excellence and equity in enrollment, instruction and administration.

Wilmington National University is an open admission college, available to anyone 18 years of age or older, anyone who is a high school graduate or holder of an equivalency diploma. If you do not have a high school diploma or an equivalency diploma, you may still enroll at Wilmington National University, your degree program will begin once skills testing, and aptitude requirements are met.

Our Goals are simple. Our Mission straight-forward. At Wilmington National University, we empower ourselves to provide opportunity for all, regardless of income, place of residence, and all other factors. We make the process of obtaining your degree, not only feasible, but economical.

A reputable and accredited university, Wilmington National University provides several degree programs. You can major in general business, or specialize in areas such as international business, finance, marketing, economics, risk management and more.

The Power of Ideas



At the Wilmington National University, we take seriously our part in the enormous task of generating new knowledge for the benefit of present and future generations. Our agenda-setting administration crosses traditional disciplinary boundaries to transform the way we understand business, economics, history, literature, religion, language and science, among other fields. In this spirit of discovery, we grant graduate and undergraduate degree's to future generations of scholars, business professionals and leaders.

Transformative Technology

As technology pioneers, we are fully engaged in the process of preparing our most beneficial, most practical, and innovative scientific discoveries for the marketplace. As we create new ideas for the marketplace, we also generate revenues for research and education.

Research



Wilmington National University's commitment to marrying programs with the creation of always furthering knowledge provides a fertile setting for research, that has spawned a host of learning breakthroughs and technological advances. We have it covered. Research, statistics and analysis. Inquire today, see how WNU can help you attain your goals. Never stop learning, Propel yourself with the help of Wilmington National University.

- [Home](#)
- |
- [About](#)
- |
- [Academics](#)
- |
- [Admissions](#)
- |
- [FAQs](#)
- |
- [Accreditation](#)
- |
- [myWNU](#)
- |
- [Terms of Use](#)
- |
- [Contact Us](#)

Copyright © 2012 Wilmington National University. All rights reserved.



OFFICE OF MAYOR LENNY CURRY

ST. JAMES BUILDING
117 W. DUVAL STREET, SUITE 400
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

TEL: (904) 630-1776
FAX: (904) 630-2391
www.coj.net

To: Steve Rohan
Interim Inspector General

From: Marlene Russell *Marlene Russell*
Director of Organizational Effectiveness

Date: September 21, 2016

SUBJECT: Response – Draft Report of Investigation
Case No. 2016-0006WB

Based on the conclusions in subject report and the recommended corrective actions from the Office of Inspector General, below are management comments regarding same.

Report Conclusion

A review of the Civil Service job specifications for the Environmental Scientist Supervisor positions (#2015-01379) and #2016-01822) reflected that the open requirements/supplemental information required applicants to have at least a Bachelor's degree. However, neither one of these job specifications explicitly state that the Bachelor's degree was to be awarded from an accredited institution.

Although, the Environmental Scientist Supervisor (#2016-01822) position supplemental question #8 read, "Do you have a bachelor's degree or higher from an *accredited* college or university? If yes, you will be required to provide a copy of your college transcripts at some point during the selection process." Hash answered "yes" to this question and relied upon her WNU diploma and transcript as proof of meeting this requirement. A review of the USDOE website revealed that WNU was not an accredited institution nor had it ever been accredited by any higher education accreditation body recognized by the USDOE.

Hash testified that she attended several courses over a two to three month period during 2012, and admitted that she did not take courses over a period of three and one-half years (March 2009 through December 2012) as reflected on the WNU transcript.

Based on testimony and records, Hash misrepresented her educational qualifications by asserting during the application process for the Environmental Scientist Supervisor (#2016-01822) position that she had obtained a degree from an accredited institution and that she had enrolled in courses (as reflected on her transcript) spanning over three and one-half years to earn a Bachelor's degree. As such, the allegation that Hash misrepresented her educational credentials to COJ Employee Services was *substantiated*.

Inspector General
Case No. 2016-0006WB
Page Two

The OIG investigation also disclosed that a lack of internal controls existed within Employee Services, specifically (1) the lack of verification of college degrees and transcripts; and (2) the lack of verification of the educational institutions related to degrees and transcripts submitted to ensure that those institutions were recognized by the USDOE. As a result of the lack of internal controls, several COJ applicants have obtained positions and/or been promoted to positions for which they did not meet the required educational qualifications. During the course of the investigation the Administration took immediate corrective action relating to the lack of internal controls, and will be outlined in the Management Comment and Corrective Action section.

Recommended Corrective Action 1:

Review, verify, and update all citywide position descriptions that require a college degree to ensure that the appropriate definition of "accredited institution" is included in all job descriptions to ensure consistency and uniformity. Provide a comprehensive list of all so- updated position descriptions. This recommendation should also extend to all future job announcements if a college degree is required.

Management Comments:

The Employee Services Department is adding the word "accredited" to all appointed employee job specifications requiring a degree. This job category will be completed by September 23, 2016. Civil Service job specifications require union notification and this part of the project will be completed by October 31, 2016. This recommendation will be extended to all future job announcements for *required* degrees.

Recommended Corrective Action 2:

Review and update applicable ordinances to ensure that the verbiage "accredited institution" is included in all ordinances that identify qualifications requiring college degrees to ensure consistency and uniformity.

Management Comments:

The attached spreadsheet (Appointed Official Position Requirements) contains a list of the appointed positions and the Ordinance Code requirements. This list includes all appointed official positions with minimum job requirements. It does not include any positions within City Council nor does it include the Constitutionals (Clerk of Courts, Supervisor of Elections, and Tax Collector's Office have no appointed official positions; whereas JSO and Property Appraiser do).

Recommended Corrective Action 3:

Develop written policies and procedures regarding the verification process of all educational credentials (i.e. college degrees, professional licenses and certifications) for all citywide positions for both internal and external COJ applicants. Consider incorporating an education verification checklist

Inspector General
Case No. 2016-0006WB
Page Three

that adheres to the State of Florida document retention guidelines for both employees and applicants.

Management Comments:

The following documents listed below describe the processes and procedures performed by the Employee Services Department to verify educational credentials, professional licenses and certifications required for City of Jacksonville positions.

- Determining Eligibility – this includes an assessment of the applicants' education and qualification requirements
- Education Verification Procedure – this provides each of the work units' responsibilities for verifying education with college/university (or postsecondary institutions)
- Verifying and Maintaining required Certifications and Licenses – this procedure outlines the process for verifying and maintaining certifications and professional licenses
- Hiring Process Checklist for Employee Services Business Partner – checklist utilized by the HR Business Partner to ensure all requirements are met prior to hire or promotion
- New Hire Attachment Checklist – checklist utilized to verify all required documents have been received

Recommended Corrective Action 4:

Consider using a third party vendor to verify that college degrees are from accredited institutions, for both internal and external applicants.

Management Comments:

The name of the clearinghouse Employee Services utilizes to verify accredited schools and to confirm that the applicant/employee has attended and/or graduated is National Student Clearinghouse (www.studentclearinghouse.org).

The Administration takes the investigation findings listed very seriously and has reviewed each recommended corrective action and responded accordingly.

Additionally, this matter has been referred to the Office of General Counsel for further investigation and review of the involved employees' actions.

**Inspector General
Case No. 2016-0006WB
Page Four**

Please let me know if you have any questions.

**cc: Lisa Green, Director of Investigations
Sam E. Mousa, P.E., Chief Administrative Officer
Kelli O'Leary, Director, Employee Services Department
Marsha Oliver, Director, Public Affairs
Sean Granat, Office of General Counsel
File No. 2016-0006WB**

**Attachments: Appointed Official Position Requirements spreadsheet
Employee Services Forms – Determining Eligibility, Education Verification Procedure
Verifying and Maintaining required Certifications and Licenses, Hiring Process
Checklist for HR Business Partner, and New Hire Attachment Checklist**

Appointed Official Position Requirements

Dept.	Job Title	Degree Required?	Degree Accredited?	Professional License Required?	Open Requirements/Supplemental Information	Ordinance Code
Downtown Investment Authority	DOWNTOWN INVESTMENT AUTHORITY/CEO	Yes	No	No	A minimum of five (5) years of progressively responsible experience in downtown redevelopment or similar capacity, at least four (4) years of which should be in a supervisory or consulting role or an equivalent combination of training and experience. A Bachelor's degree is required in a related field such as city planning, real estate, finance, architecture, urban design, or public administration, with a strong preference for a Master's degree in a related discipline, all as described in further detail in the DIA CEO Qualifications and Criteria Schedule attached as Revised Exhibit 1 to Ordinance 2012-680-E.	Sec 55 108
Employee Services	DIRECTOR OF EMPLOYEE SERVICES	Yes	Yes	No	Shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and at least five (5) years full time experience in human resources management.	Sec 33 102
Employee Services	CHIEF OF COMPENSATION AND BENEFITS	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university, proven administrative ability, and at least five years' experience in the field of compensation and employee benefits management.	Sec 33 302
Employee Services	CHIEF OF EMPLOYEE AND LABOR RELATIONS	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university, proven administrative ability, and at least five years of experience in the field of labor and employment law.	Sec 33 402
Employee Services	CHIEF OF TALENT MANAGEMENT	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university, proven administrative ability, and at least five years' of experience in the field of employee recruiting, training, and employee services management.	Sec 33 202
Finance and Administration	DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATION/ CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER	Yes	Yes	No	Shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university in finance, accounting, business administration, public administration, or a similar field, and seven (7) years' experience in public or governmental finance, three of which are in a management capacity. Must possess a thorough understanding of the principles of municipal finance, budgeting, and accounting, and of applicable provisions of the Laws of the State of Florida, or an equivalent combination of education, experience, and accounting, and possess proven administrative ability, and a record of exceptional performance in an executive level public or private sector financial management position.	Sec 24 102
Finance and Administration	BUDGET OFFICER	Yes	Yes	No	Bachelor's Degree or higher from an accredited college or university in business, accounting or public administration, and at least five years' experience in budget preparation or public management.	Sec 24 502
Finance and Administration	CHIEF OF FLEET MANAGEMENT	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university or other commensurate training and experience and at least five years' experience in an administrative or executive position in the management, maintenance, and repair of motor vehicles, equipment, or similar operations.	Sec 24 802
Finance and Administration	CHIEF OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGIES	Yes	Yes	No	Bachelors' Degree from an accredited institution and five or more years of progressively responsible related experience in information technology, systems, strategic planning and project management or any equivalent combination of education, experience and training that provides the required knowledge, skills and abilities.	Sec 24 702
Finance and Administration	CHIEF OF PROCUREMENT DIVISION	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and at least five years of experience in an administrative or executive position as a purchasing agent for a business, corporation, governmental body or have a law degree or other commensurate training and experience.	Sec 24 602
Finance and Administration	CITY COMPTROLLER	Yes	Yes	No	Bachelors' Degree or higher in an accredited college or university in accounting and at least five years supervisory experience in general accounting or equivalent training and experience.	Sec 24 302
Finance and Administration	RISK MANAGER	Yes	Yes	No	Bachelors' Degree or higher in an accredited college or university in business, insurance and/or risk management or a law degree and at least five years' experience in insurance and risk management activities, including workers' compensation, automobile and general liability matters at a professional level.	Sec 24 402
Finance and Administration	TREASURER	Yes	Yes	No	Bachelors' Degree or higher from an accredited college or university in finance, accounting, business management or a related subject and shall have substantial experience in the area of public or private financial management. Professional designations such as CFA, CPA, CFP, and CTP desired.	Sec 24 202

Appointed Official Position Requirements

Dept.	Job Title	Degree Required?	Degree Accredited?	Professional License Required?	Open Requirements/Supplemental Information	Ordinance Code
Fire and Rescue	DIRECTOR OF FIRE AND RESCUE	Yes	Yes	No	Must possess a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and have a minimum of five years administrative experience in the field of public safety, or commensurate training and experience.	Sec 31.101
Fire and Rescue	CHIEF OF FIRE OPERATIONS	No	No	No	The Chief, Fire Operations shall have at least five years' experience in the administration of firefighting, emergency medical or rescue personnel, equipment and apparatus; or commensurate training and experience.	Sec 31.202
Fire and Rescue	CHIEF OF FIRE TRAINING	No	No	No	The Chief shall have at least five years' experience in the administration, training or management of fire fighting, emergency medical or rescue personnel, equipment and apparatus.	Sec 31.402
Fire and Rescue	CHIEF OF RESCUE	No	No	No	The Chief shall have at least five years' experience in the administration or management of firefighting, emergency medical or rescue personnel, equipment and apparatus.	Sec 31.302
Fire and Rescue	CHIEF OF FIRE PREVENTION	No	No	No	The Chief shall have had at least five years' administrative or executive experience.	Sec 31.502
Fire and Rescue	CHIEF OF EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS	No	No	No	The Chief shall have had at least five years' administrative or executive experience.	Sec 31.602
General Counsel's Office	GENERAL COUNSEL	No	NA	Yes	Shall be an attorney licensed to practice law in the State of Florida and have at least five (5) years' experience in the practice of law.	Sec 25.102
Inspector General	INSPECTOR GENERAL	Yes	Yes	No	A bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university, and at least ten years of experience in government auditing, investigation, or prosecutorial or criminal justice administration, public administration or business administration. A master's degree or higher is preferred. Professional certifications such as certified inspector general, certified inspector general auditor or investigator, certified public accountant, certified internal auditor, or certified fraud examiner are recommended. The Inspector General shall not have been found guilty of or entered a plea of nolo contendere to any felony, or any misdemeanor involving the breach of public trust. Unless a certification is already held, the Inspector General shall be required to obtain certification within 24 months of becoming the Inspector General. Preferred experience: Ten (10) years of responsible work in Federal, State, or Local law enforcement officer/official or as an Inspector General, or ten (10) years of responsible work as a Certified Public Accountant, Internal Auditor government attorney with expertise in investigating fraud, mismanagement and corruption or as a person with progressive supervisory and management experience in an investigative public agency similar to an Inspector General's Office; including ten (10) years of related supervision; or any equivalent combination of related training and experience.	Sec 602.304
Medical Examiner	DISTRICT CHIEF MEDICAL EXAMINER	No	NA	Yes	A practicing physician in pathology that is a member of the Medical Examiners Commission shall be eligible to serve as a district medical examiner upon approval by the Governor. (Fl 406.06)	FS 406.06
Military Affairs and Veterans	DIRECTOR OF MILITARY AND VETERANS AFFAIRS	Yes	Yes	No	The Director shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and have at least five years of administrative experience.	Sec 22.102
Neighborhoods	DIRECTOR OF NEIGHBORHOODS	Yes	Yes	No	The Director shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and at least five years of experience in an administrative or executive position.	Sec 34.102
Neighborhoods	OPERATIONS DIRECTOR/NEIGHBORHOODS	Yes	Yes	No	The Operations Director shall have a four year degree from an accredited university or college, and a minimum of five years of experience in an administrative or regulatory position.	Sec 34.103
Neighborhoods	CHIEF OF ANIMAL CARE AND PROTECTIVE SERVICES	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and at least five years of management experience preferably in the management of an animal care facility.	Sec 34.602
Neighborhoods	CHIEF OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY	Yes	Yes	Yes	The Chief shall have a bachelors degree or higher from an accredited college or university with five years of engineering or pollution control experience, including at least two years of experience in air and water pollution control activities and shall be registered by the State of Florida as a Professional Engineer within one year of appointment.	Sec 34.402
Neighborhoods	CHIEF OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT	Yes	Yes	No	Shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and at least (5) five years of experience in affordable housing or in community planning, and have proven administrative experience.	Sec 34.202

Appointed Official Position Requirements

Dept.	Job Title	Degree Required?	Degree Accredited?	Professional License Required?	Open Requirements/Supplemental Information	Ordinance Code
Neighborhoods	CHIEF OF MOSQUITO CONTROL	Yes	Yes	Yes	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and shall have at least five years of experience in mosquito control. Per Chapter 388, F.S., SE-13.032, candidate must hold a valid Public Health Pest Control license and a State Director's Certification prior to appointment or obtain the Director's Certification within six (6) months of employment.	Sec 34.502
Neighborhoods	CHIEF OF MUNICIPAL CODE COMPLIANCE	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and at least five years of experience in an administrative or management position.	Sec 34.302
Office of Economic Development	ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OFFICER	Yes	Yes	No	The Officer shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited university or college. The officer shall possess at least ten years professional experience in commercial real estate, deal structuring, fundamental economics, banking or related legal experience and high-level negotiations, which must include at least two years of economic development and financial analysis.	Sec 26.102
Parks, Rec and Comm Services	DIRECTOR OF PARKS, RECREATION, AND COMMUNITY SERVICES	Yes	Yes	No	The Director shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university in recreation management, sociology, psychology, public/business administration, management or similar field and at least five years of progressively responsible experience in a management or executive position. Certification within field of expertise is preferred.	Sec 28.102
Parks, Rec and Comm Services	CHIEF OF DISABLED SERVICES	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and have at least five years of administrative experience in at least one of the areas of responsibility.	Sec 28.902
Parks, Rec and Comm Services	CHIEF OF NATURAL AND MARINE RESOURCES	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and at least five years of management or executive experience in natural resource recreation.	Sec 28.402
Parks, Rec and Comm Services	CHIEF OF RECREATION & COMMUNITY PROGRAMMING	Yes	Yes	Yes	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university in the recreation field and at least five years of progressive management experience in the recreation field and be a Certified Park & Recreation Professional or Certified Park & Recreation Executive.	Sec 28.302
Parks, Rec and Comm Services	CHIEF OF SENIOR SERVICES	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university in psychology, sociology or a related field and at least five years of experience in the social services or related field.	Sec 28.602
Parks, Rec and Comm Services	CHIEF OF SOCIAL SERVICES	Yes	Yes	No	The Chief shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university in sociology, psychology or a related field and have at least five years of administrative experience in at least one of the areas of responsibility.	Sec 28.502
Planning and Development	DIRECTOR OF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT	No	No	No	Possess a master's degree in public administration, urban planning or a related field or shall have ten years' professional and administrative experience in a managerial capacity, at least five of which shall be in an urban planning agency or organization. The Chief shall possess a Standard Building Code Administrators license, pursuant to F.S. § 468.609, and shall have been employed by the building inspection component of a municipal government for at least one year. A preference shall be given to individuals who have had at least five years of experience as a Certified Building Contractor or Certified General Contractor.	Sec 30.101
Planning and Development	CHIEF OF BUILDING INSPECTION	No	NA	Yes	Possess bachelor's degree or higher in an accredited college or university degree in urban or regional planning, geography or civil engineering, community planning, architecture, landscape architecture, public administration or related field and at least seven years' experience in comprehensive community planning or at least five years of experience with a master's degree in any of the listed fields, or commensurate training and experience, and shall have proven administrative experience.	Sec 30.602
Planning and Development	CHIEF OF COMMUNITY PLANNING	Yes	Yes	No	Possess a college degree in urban planning, community planning, regional planning, architecture, geography or landscape architecture public administration or related field and at least seven years' experience in comprehensive community planning, or at least five years of experience with a master's degree in any of the listed fields, or commensurate training and experience, and shall have proven administrative experience.	Sec 34.202
Planning and Development	CHIEF OF CURRENT PLANNING	Yes	No	No	Possess a college degree in urban planning, community planning, regional planning, architecture, geography or landscape architecture public administration or related field and at least seven years' experience in comprehensive community planning, or at least five years of experience with a master's degree in any of the listed fields, or commensurate training and experience, and shall have proven administrative experience.	Sec 30.302

Appointed Official Position Requirements

Dept.	Job Title	Degree Required?	Degree Accredited?	Professional License Required?	Open Requirements/Supplemental Information	Ordinance Code
Planning and Development	CHIEF OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES	Yes	Yes	No	Possess bachelor's degree or higher in an accredited college or university in urban or regional planning, geography or civil engineering, community planning, architecture, landscape architecture, public administration or related field and at least seven years' experience in civil engineering or at least five years of experience with a master's degree in any of the listed fields, or ten years' experience in civil engineering with an associate's degree in civil engineering or commensurate training and experience, and shall have proven administrative experience.	Sec 30 502
Planning and Development	CHIEF OF TRANSPORTATION PLANNING	Yes	No	No	Possess a college degree in urban planning or urban design or related field and have at least 10 years' experience in transportation planning and management experience, or at least five years of transportation experience with a master's degree in any of the listed fields, or commensurate training and experience, and shall have proven administrative experience.	Sec 30 802
Public Library	LIBRARY DIRECTOR	Yes	Yes	No	A Master's degree in Library or Information Science from an American Library Association accredited school and ten years professional experience in a large and diverse library system to include at least five years in library management at the senior level with budget experience. Must be able to work with a large and diverse population; must possess a thorough knowledge and understanding of the principles of public librarianship, customer service, and organizational dynamics.	Sec 90 103
Public Works	DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS	No	NA	Yes	The Director shall be registered by the State of Florida as a Professional Engineer and have at least five years experience in industrial or municipal public works.	Sec 32 101
Public Works	OPERATIONS DIRECTOR/PUBLIC WORKS	No	NA	Yes	The Operations Director shall be registered by the State of Florida as a Professional Engineer and have at least five (5) years of management or executive experience.	Sec 32 104
Public Works	CHIEF OF ENGINEERING & CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT	No	NA	Yes	Shall be registered by the State of Florida as a Professional Engineer and have at least five years' experience as an engineer in the public works field or in private industry. The City Engineer shall serve as staff to the Context Sensitive Streets Standards Committee set forth in Section 32.702, Ordinance Code and serve as the Chairman of the Subdivision Standards and Policy Advisory Committee.	Sec 32 202
Public Works	CHIEF OF MOWING AND LANDSCAPE MAINTENANCE	No	No	No	The Division Chief shall have a minimum of seven years supervising <i>landscape maintenance and mowing</i> for government entities. Candidates with horticulturist, arborist, agribusiness or <i>landscape architecture</i> degrees should be given preference.	Sec 32 802
Public Works	CHIEF OF PUBLIC BUILDINGS	No	NA	No	The Chief shall have at least five years experience in maintenance work.	Sec 32 502
Public Works	CHIEF OF REAL ESTATE	Yes	Yes	No	Shall have a bachelor's degree or higher from an accredited college or university and at least five (5) years real estate experience in industry, government, brokerage or appraisal.	Sec 32 402
Public Works	CHIEF OF RIGHT OF WAY AND STORMWATER MAINTENANCE	Yes	No	Yes	Shall have a four year degree in engineering, construction or construction management. Must be a registered Professional Engineer with a license in the State of Florida. A minimum of 5 years experience in managing buildings or working in the fields of building management, traffic engineering, or roadway and drainage design and maintenance.	Sec 32 302
Public Works	CHIEF OF SOLID WASTE DIVISION	Yes	Yes	No	Shall have a bachelor's degree or higher in an accredited college or university and at least five (5) years management experience in the solid waste industry.	Sec 32 602
Public Works	CHIEF OF TRAFFIC ENGINEERING	No	NA	Yes	Shall be registered as a Professional Engineer and have at least five years traffic engineering experience in a responsible capacity. Bachelor's degree is required. Eight years of professional experience in the areas of Sports and Entertainment. A minimum of five years of senior level administrative experience, preferably with a background in a sports related organization is preferred. Knowledge and experience in budgeting, financial management, public relations, and communication with support groups, sponsors, and volunteers is required.	Sec 32 902
Sports and Entertainment	SPORTS AND ENTERTAINMENT OFFICER	Yes	No	No		Sec 27 102

EMPLOYEE SERVICES

Procedures



Revised: 7/14/16, 6/28/16
 Established: 8/19/15

Determining Eligibility for Internal and External Recruitment

Definition This procedure details the process for determining eligibility for internal and external postings. Guidelines for eligibility lists are also include.

Responsible HR Specialist and HR Business Partner

Corresponding Directive

Notes

Procedure:

Actions	Description	Responsible
1. Moving Applicants through NEOGOV	<p><u>Step 1</u> (Applications Received):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Move all applicants to step 2. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Select <i>Go to Supplemental Questionnaire</i> b. Select <i>All</i> <p><u>Step 2</u> (Supplemental Questionnaire): The system scores the responses to the questions based on the scoring plan that was set up in NEOGOV.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Move all applicants with a passing score to Step 3 <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Select <i>Advance to Next Step</i> b. Select <i>Passing</i> 2. Check the responses for the first few failing to ensure the scoring plan is set up correctly. 3. Send an email notification to failed applicants. 	HR Specialist/HR Business Partner

Actions	Description	Responsible
	<p>a. Select <i>Email Notify</i></p> <p>b. Select <i>Failed or Selected</i>. (Use selected when some applicants have already received a notice.)</p> <p>c. Choose template: <i>Did Not Meet Minimum Qualifications - Supplemental Questionnaire</i></p> <p><u>Step 3</u> (Minimum Qualifications Review):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Determine eligibility based on the minimum qualifications required for the job. See "Eligibility" below for additional information. 2. Send a notice to applicants. Notices should be sent after eligibility has been determined for continuous recruitment or after the close date. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Select <i>Email Notify</i> b. Select <i>Failed or Passed</i> c. Select the appropriate template (see "Templates" below). d. Select <i>Generate Notice or Edit</i> (if changes are needed) e. Select <i>Send</i> 	
Templates	<p>Eligible Applicants:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Civil Service – Use "<i>Placed on Eligibility List - Civil Service</i>" • Non-Civil Service – Use "<i>Eligible - Non-Civil Service</i>" <p>Ineligible Applicants:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use template: <i>Ineligible - External</i> (Applicants determined ineligible in Step 3 may be able to provide additional information for their application to be reconsidered.) <p>Internal Applicants:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Eligible applicants – Do not send a 	HR Specialist/HR Business Partner

Actions	Description	Responsible
	<p>template. The Exam team will notify them of the test or if there isn't a test the HR Business Partner will contact them.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ineligible: Internal applicants have an appeal period. Select the appropriate reason they did not meet the minimum qualifications. There are templates set up as Internal - ... This should be done right away so that filling the job is not delayed. 	
<p>2. Determining Eligibility - External Recruitment</p> <p>Guidelines</p>	<p>Review application to determine if the applicant has the required experience as specified in the job posting under open requirements.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As of 5/13/15 any jobs posted on or after this date; part-time and volunteer experience will be considered if the applicant has worked 20 - 39 hours per week. Number of hours worked will be converted to full-time hours. Example; working 20 hpw for 6 months would equal to 3 months of full-time experience. If a college degree is required or certain college credit is required, a copy of the college transcripts is required. College transcripts are reviewed to ensure the degree is in an appropriate field as indicated on the job spec. If a degree is not required, but education is being substituted for experience transcripts will be required if candidate is selected. If no transcripts are provided, the applicant is sent an e-mail saying "it 	<p>HR Specialist/HR Business Partner</p>

Actions	Description	Responsible
	<p>has been determined you do not meet the minimum qualifications for this position due to not providing a copy of the required college transcript.”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Internships are not considered full-time professional experience and cannot be counted toward required experience unless the internship was held after college and was not required as part of the applicants college education. • For any position for which a degree or course work is required or submitted to count toward the requirements, coursework must be verified to be from an institution accredited by the U.S. Department of Education. For schools outside the U.S., the education must be converted to U.S. credits/semesters. The conversion is the responsibility of the applicant. The applicant will not be deemed eligible until the conversion occurs. An eligibility list may be amended for this reason. 	
<p>Determining Eligibility for Internal Recruitment</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review applications for eligibility. • Check Oracle to verify applicants have required minimum amount of time (i.e. must have served in the class of — for two years.) and no discipline in the last 12 months. If discipline is indicated, contact Labor Relations to see if they are eligible to test. • Send email notifications to those that failed. They have 5 business days to appeal decision. • Notify HR Business Partner and Exam Team once eligibility is complete. 	

Actions	Description	Responsible
<p>4. College Credit</p>	<p>For jobs requiring a college degree, applicants must have the degree as indicated in the requirements. A copy of college transcripts must be provided and verified.</p> <p>For jobs requiring a combination of education and/or experience, a copy of college transcripts is not required with application, but will be required at time of interview. Credit will be given as indicated below.</p> <p>Related College Degrees:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Associate's = 2 years • Bachelor's = 4 years • Master's = 5 years • Doctorate = 6 years • Unrelated = 2 years <p>See table in back of procedure for further instructions regarding years of experience credited for degree or semester hours.</p> <p>For jobs requiring a certain amount of course work be completed a copy of college transcripts are required.</p> <p>For any position for which a degree or course work is required or submitted to count toward the requirements, coursework must be verified to be from an institution accredited by the U.S. Department of Education.</p> <p>Foreign Credit Hours or Degree:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Based on Equivalency Determination. • Applicants are responsible for providing this document. <p>Sources include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Josef Silny & Associates, (305) 273-1616, www.jsilny.com • Educational Credential Evaluators, 	

Actions	Description	Responsible
	<p>P.O. Box 17499, Milwaukee, WI 53217</p> <p>Vocational Credit Hours:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Considered on a case-by-case basis. • Research certification to determine experience equivalent. <p>Many times no credit is given for vocational or certificate programs.</p> <p>Accounting Course Credit Hours: 12 semester hours of college level accounting coursework is required for most accounting positions. Determinations can be made by reviewing transcripts (accounting classes are designated as following prefixes (level 100 or above):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ACC, ACT or ATG <p>The following do not count as accounting classes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FIN (Finance), ECO (Economics), STA (Statistics) <p>Note: All courses must have been successfully completed and awarded quality points for credit. Courses must be from accredited college or university. Refer to website: www.ope.ed.gov/accreditation</p> <p>Quarter hours: Convert to semester hours by dividing by 1.5</p> <p>CEUs (Continuing Education Units): 4.5 CEUs = 1 semester hour 1 hour of instruction = 1/10 of a CEU</p> <p>Military Training: Contact Veterans Services at 630-3680.</p>	

Actions	Description	Responsible
<p>5. Eligibility Lists</p> <p>Guidelines</p> <p>Setting up Expiration Dates</p> <p>Reassign Exam</p>	<p>Lifespan of Eligibility Lists:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • External Civil Service – 1 year • Internal Promotional Civil Service (Priority I) – 2 years • Internal Priority II – 90 days • Non-Civil Service – 90 days <p>Note: A priority II list is good for 90 days. It can be turned into an external eligibility list after the 90 days has expired.</p> <p>Continuous Recruitment – Each applicant will become inactive one year from date eligibility is determined.</p> <p>Postings with a close date – All applicants will become inactive on the same date. The expiration date can be specified when applicants are placed on the list. (The current date is the default.)</p> <p>Postings with a large number of applicants where eligibility is not completed will expire on the same date.</p> <p>Postings that are reopened, the expiration date will need to be changed for the new applicants or a new list can be created for the new round of applicants.</p> <p>Setting up the expiration date in NEOGOV is done in the Exam Plan. Look for the heading titled "Eligibility List."</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Click on 'Edit' under actions 2. Name the list using the job title. 3. Enter the date you want it to expire or type in 365 days. (It has to be one or the other. The system will not accept both fields filled out.) <p>The expiration date can also be changed at the time the applicants are placed on the eligibility list. The date field is at the top. The current date is the default.</p> <p>Once the HR Specialist has completed</p>	

Actions	Description	Responsible
Plan	<p>his/her part of the Exam Plan it will be reassigned. If an exam is required, reassign to the Exam Team. If no exam, reassign to the HR Business Partner.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Click on 'Edit' for the job posting. 2. Change the name the exam plan is assigned to. 	
Closing out the Requisition	<p>Once the list has expired the requisition can be closed out. This will remove the requisition from the dashboard (My HR page).</p> <p>Closing out the requisition can be done from the dashboard.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Enter the requisition number in the search field above the column "Requisitions." 2. Click on "Authorize." 3. Change the status to filled or cancelled. 4. In the comments section indicate what happened with the list; who filled the job, there were no eligible applicants, cancelled, etc. 	

RELATED UNDERGRADUATE COURSE WORK EXPERIENCE (Max of 2 years of experience)	
Degree	Years of Experience Credited
60 semester or 90 quarter hours	2 years
50 semester or 75 quarter hours	1 year 8 months
45 semester or 67.5 quarter hours	1 year 6 months
40 semester or 60 quarter hours	1 year 4 months
30 semester or 45 quarter hours	1 year
20 semester or 30 quarter hours	8 months
15 semester or 22 1/2 quarter hours	6 months
10 semester or 15 quarter hours	4 months
RELATED MASTERS COURSE COURSEWORK EXPERIENCE (Max of 1 year experience)	
30 semester or 45 quarter hours	1 year
20 semester or 30 quarter hours	8 months
15 semester or 22 1/2 quarter hours	6 months
10 semester or 15 quarter hours	4 months
RELATED DOCTORATE COURSE WORK EXPERIENCE (Max of 2 years of experience)	
60 semester or 90 quarter hours	2 years
50 semester or 75 quarter hours	1 year 8 months
45 semester or 67.5 quarter hours	1 year 6 months
40 semester or 60 quarter hours	1 year 4 months
30 semester or 45 quarter hours	1 year
20 semester or 30 quarter hours	8 months
15 semester or 22 1/2 quarter hours	6 months
10 semester or 15 quarter hours	4 months

EMPLOYEE SERVICES

Procedures



Revised: July 14, 2016
Established: July 11, 2016

Education Verification Procedures

Definition This procedure details the process for verifying education during the application review process for departments under the Mayor's authority.

Authority Civil Service and Personnel Rules and Regulations, Rule 4.02(3)(a)

New Employees (External Hires)

During the on-boarding process, the applicant will complete the education verification and consent form. The DM HR Specialist is responsible for this step of the process.

The DM HR Specialist will immediately remove from the packet and copy the education verification forms after the on-boarding session.

The DM HR Specialist will provide copies of the education verification forms plus the roster for on-boarding to the HR Coordinator within the HR Business Partner/Recruiting group who is responsible for ensuring verification

The HR Coordinator will review positions for which the education verification must be completed based on the position listed on the on-boarding roster. The list of positions is located in G/Shared/ Jobs with Degree Requirements. The HR Business Partners are tasked with keeping the list up to date as jobs are added or deleted. The education verification documents will then be provided to the Administrative Aide in the Director's office for education verification using the purchasing card. The HR BP will notify the HR Coordinator and the DM HR Specialist of any changes to the start date for new employees.

Once the education verification is complete, the Administrative Aide will provide the scanned verification to the Data Management mailbox (datamgtrequests@coj.net) with a copy to the HR Coordinator and the departmental HR BP.

The HR Coordinator will track which verifications are sent to Data Management and will be responsible for ensuring the verification process is being completed prior to the employee's start date (if possible).

Verifications that are not completed by the employee's start date will be brought to the attention of both the Division Chief of Talent Management and the Manager of the Business Partner Group.

Current Employees Promoting Into Classes with Educational Requirements

The HR Specialists within the HR Business Partner Group/Recruiting who are responsible for determining eligibility will screen employees for minimum qualifications including education (see Determining Eligibility procedure).

Employees must provide transcripts during the application period for positions requiring education or for which education is being used to meet the minimum requirements.

If education is a job requirement for the position the employee has applied for, the HR Specialist will review the Oracle record to see if there is a verification on file or will send the employee the Education Verification Authorization Form for completion.

The employee will be required to provide the completed form back within 5 days of receipt of the forms. (Exceptions will be allowed if the employee is out of the office).

Upon receipt of the form, the HR Specialist will provide the Education Verification Authorization Form to the Administrative Aide in the Director's office for education verification using the purchasing card.

Once the education verification is complete, the Administrative Aide will provide the scanned verification back to the HR Specialist to complete determining eligibility.

The HR Specialist will be responsible for ensuring the employee meets the eligibility requirements prior to the exam date.

Verifications that are not completed by the exam date will be brought to the attention of both the Division Chief of Talent Management and the Manager of the Business Partner Group.

Once the education verification is complete, the HR Specialist will provide the scanned verification to the Data Management mailbox (datamgtrequests@coj.net) with a copy to the departmental HR BP.

Reassignments or Lateral Transfers with Educational Requirements

The HR Business Partner is responsible to verify whether a degree is required for a position that another employee is being reassigned into or laterally transferred into. If so, he/she should follow the same process as for promotions.

NOTE: For positions that require coursework but do not require a degree, transcripts must be reviewed during the eligibility process (see Determining Eligibility procedure) and submitted for verification to the Administrative Aide following the above process.

For positions for which education is counting towards the minimum qualifications, verification must be completed following the process outlined above. It is the HR Coordinator's responsibility to review the on-boarding roster and review the supplemental questions in NeoGov which would indicate whether education is being used as part of the minimum qualifications.

For degrees or coursework requirements that are not verified through the Clearinghouse, the HR Coordinator will verify directly with the school.

EMPLOYEE SERVICES

Procedures



Revised: 6/30/16
 Established: 8/19/15

Verifying and Maintaining Required Professional Licenses and Certifications

Definition The standards set forth in this procedure are to detail how to verify professional licenses and certifications, as well as maintain the database with most current professional licenses and certifications required for specific positions within the City of Jacksonville.

Responsible HR Coordinator

Corresponding Directive

Notes

Procedure:

Actions	Description	Responsible
<p>Keeping the Master Spreadsheet</p>	<p>A master spreadsheet is kept in order to determine which license/certifications are required by department and positions. The spreadsheet must be kept current. The Business Partners are responsible for adding new positions that require licenses/certifications to the master spreadsheet.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Master Spreadsheet is located in G:/Secured/Certifications/Master List-Certifications.xlsx 2. If there are questions about what job requires which license and/or certification, refer to the above mentioned spreadsheet or contact the HR Business Partner for the 	<p>HR Specialist/HR Business Partner</p>

Actions	Description	Responsible
	assigned department.	
Database Access and Reporting	<p>Must have access to the PW Personnel database. Requests for access must be made through the employee's manager. The employee's manager will request access through the IT Division.</p> <p>A report must be run each month to determine upcoming expirations of Licenses/Certifications. Report is run on the 29th or 30th each month for the upcoming month (example: Run report June 29th for month of July). Follow the steps below to run report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Click on PW Personnel icon • Top left hand corner click "File" and "Open" • There are four icons, double click on the one that looks like a pie, which will bring up a reporting menu • Select the Report: "Certification Due to Expire" • Start Date: Use the 1st day of the upcoming month • End Date: Use the last date of the upcoming month • There is a blue button at the bottom, click on "Check All Divisions" • There is a blue button to the right, click on "View Report" • Verify the date parameters are correct and "print" <p>Notify employees and their supervisors of their upcoming license/certification expirations via email. Each email should</p>	HR Coordinator

Actions	Description	Responsible
	<p>Include the following information:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Emails will be sent out individually per person, not as a group email • Identify the manager/supervisor of each employee • Copy the following on the e-mail: Manager of Business Partners, Chief of Talent Management, and employee's supervisor/manager • All e-mailed information should include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Subject line to include name of expiring certification/license. (Example: Automobile A5 Brakes Certification - Expiration Approaching) ➤ Body of email should include specific name of certification/license due to expire ➤ The date license/certification is due to expire <i>(on report)</i> ➤ Provide the employee with a deadline to provide renewed copy (NOTE: Monday of the last week of the month, this gives employees a 3-week period of time to obtain renewal) ➤ Follow up with the employee (cc: Manager of Business Partners, Chief of Talent Management and supervisor/manager) a couple of days prior to the deadline if necessary. 	
Updating Database(s)	Once the renewed copies of license/certification are obtained, update	HR Coordinator

Actions	Description	Responsible
	<p>the PW Personnel and Oracle databases. (The PW Personnel database tracks expirations and renewals and Oracle database is where the license/certification is stored.)</p> <p>Updating PW Personnel database:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Click on PW Personnel icon • Top left hand corner click "File" and "Open" • Conduct a search by last name. If employee name does not come up, search by employee #, as sometimes last names can vary. They have to be in the system if they are on report. • Once you identify correct employee, double click on line with their name and it will take you to that record • You will notice several tabs, you want to work under the tab labeled "Job Certification". You will see you can have a maximum of five certifications per person. You may have to click through the tabs #1 through #5, to find the applicable license/certification you are updating. • You will need to update the expiration date every time and the completion date, if you have that information. Take a look at your copy, identify the new expiration date and input. Some license/certifications will provide the completion date and some do not. • Click on the button "Save Certification." The record will not 	

Actions	Description	Responsible
	<p>save until you click this button.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To go to the next record, go back to search tab, input in last name, identify correct employee and double click on line with their name on it. <p>Updating Oracle database:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Click on Oracle icon (NOTE: <i>must have e-HR responsibility</i>) • Select "Okay" • Double click on "COJ Attachment" • In Name field type in last name and "Go" • Select correct record by clicking in blank box • Select "Action" button to the right • Under COJ Attachments you will click on "Add" • Attach document "Yes" • Start date will be date you are attaching document • End date can be left blank • Click on "Apply" button • Click on "Next" button to the right <p>Under Additional Information, click "Add Document"</p> <p>➤ TITLE: Last Name, first initial, abbreviate name of certification</p>	

Actions	Description	Responsible
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ DESCRIPTION: Same as TITLE ➤ CATEGORY: Miscellaneous • Click on "Browse" button • Go to where you have document saved and double click on the document • Verify all information is correct • Click "Apply" button • View to ensure correct document is saved • Click on "Submit" button, once verified 	
<p>Adding a New Record/Tracking New hires</p>	<p>If a new employee is hired and their position requires a license/certification for the position in which they were hired, you will need to obtain a copy of their current license/certification. You will need to verify that record was added to their Oracle record. If not, you will need to add a copy to their Oracle file. Typically, the Business Partner will notify you of these new hires along with a copy of the license/certification, and this will trigger you to check once they are added to Oracle.</p> <p>New employees are automatically added to the PW Personnel database when they are processed through Oracle. You should not have to ever add new employees to this database. This does not include JSO and other constitutionals. You will not be tracking licenses or certifications for such employees.</p> <p>IMPORTANT: Once applicants are added to the PW Personnel database, ensure the required license and/or certification information is in database along with an</p>	<p>HR Specialist</p>

Actions	Description	Responsible
	expiration date for tracking purposes. This can be done at the end of each month when you run the expiration report.	

HR BUSINESS PARTNER - HIRING PROCESS CHECKLIST

1. FILLING A VACANCY

NAME OF POSITION TO BE POSTED: _____

CONFIRMED THAT A CURRENT ELIGIBILITY LIST DOES NOT EXIST Yes No
(NeoGov, Portal, G:Shared:Promotion Lists-All)

SUBMIT REQUISITION FOR JOB POSTING

Posting Type Priority 1 Priority 2 External
Assembled Yes No
If yes, has exam committee been identified Yes No
Unassembled Yes No

BUDGETED AMOUNT OF POSITION BEING OFFERED: \$ _____

IS THE BUDGETED AMOUNT LESS THAN OR GREATER THAN THE SALARY BEING REQUESTED?
(No offers are to be made until approved by MBRC)

Less Than Greater Than

If requested salary is less than budgeted amount, does not need MBRC approval
If requested salary is greater than budgeted amount, MBRC approval is required

HAS MBRC MEMO BEEN PREPARED FOR REVIEW AND SIGNATURE? (The memo needs to be reviewed by Tracey, Diane, the department, and Kelli)

Yes No Not applicable

WAS MBRC MEMO APPROVED?

Yes No Not applicable

2. OFFER LETTER (see template)

CANDIDATE NAME: _____

DATE POSITION OFFERED: _____ START DATE: _____

SALARY: Hourly: \$ _____ Monthly: \$ _____ Annually: \$ _____

PROBATIONARY PERIOD:

6 months 1 year no probationary period

LOCATION: _____

SUPERVISOR: _____

ADDITIONAL PHYSICAL OR LIFT TEST REQUIRED? Yes No
(Check job description to see if position required lifting of 50 pounds or more)

ARE CERTIFICATIONS REQUIRED? Yes No
If so, were copies of certifications provided? Yes No

ARE PROFESSIONAL LICENSES REQUIRED? Yes No
If so, were copies of licenses provided? Yes No

IS A DEGREE REQUIRED? Yes No
If so, were copies of transcripts provided? Yes No

IS POSITION SAFETY SENSITIVE/DOT? Yes No

SENT E-MAIL TO CANDIDATE WITH NEW HIRE PACKET Yes No
(Include date of new hire appointment and location)

3. MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS

FULL-TIME or PART-TIME:

Full-time Position
 P1 P2 External

Part-time Position
 with benefits without benefits

If part-time, how many hours per week? _____

VETERAN: Yes No
 DD-214 provided DD-214 not provided Not applicable

If candidate hired is not a vet, then non-vet memo will need to be provided by department and reviewed by the HRBP (see template)

IS THERE A HIGHER START RATE ESTABLISHED FOR THIS POSITION? Yes No

AAR Applicable? Yes No
If yes, complete if requested salary is above the start rate.

CONDUCT AAR ANALYSIS TO DETERMINE IF CURRENT EMPLOYEES AND EMPLOYEES IN THE CLASS SERIES ARE IMPACTED

Yes No

4. ITEMS TO BE SENT TO DATA MANAGEMENT

IS OFFER LETTER ATTACHED? Yes No
IS VETERAN LETTER ATTACHED, if applicable? Yes No Not applicable

IS AAR OR MBRC MEMO ATTACHED, if applicable? Yes Not applicable
ARE CERTIFICATIONS ATTACHED, if applicable? Yes No
(send copy to Dawn Daly)

ARE PROFESSIONAL LICENSES ATTACHED, if applicable? (send copy to Dawn Daly)
 Yes No

POSITION ASSIGNED WITH EFFECTIVE DATE: (Use oldest vacancy first) _____

SUBORDINATES ASSIGNED? Yes Not applicable
If yes, provide names and EINs

HAS NEW HIRE BEEN PUSHED THROUGH NEOGOV? Yes No

NEW HIRE ATTACHMENT CHECKLIST

Name _____

Organization (Index Code) _____ Hire Date _____

REQUIRED ATTACHMENTS (Check All Applicable Boxes)

- Employment Eligibility (Form I-9)
- Policy Acknowledgements and Loyalty Statement (Must obtain two witness signatures, one at supervisory level, and provide required documents to employee. Some policy acknowledgements may be optional dependent upon hiring position.)
- Supplemental Information Form

ADDITIONAL (Required Only If Applicable)

- Pension Election Form (General Employees Pension), Application, Corrections Officers PA-1, or Application for Police and Fire
- Statement Concerning Employment in a Job Not Covered by Social Security (Applies to employees enrolling in a Pension Plan)
- Request for Confidentiality of Employee Information (refer to HR Directive # 110)
- Verification and copy of certificates, licenses, transcripts, etc. as listed below. (Note: Remove or cover SSN if shown on documents)
- Advanced Appointment Rate Letter (refer to HR Directive # 116)
- Oath Form (authorized for Mayor, Council Members, Appointed Officials confirmed by Council and Appointees to Non-advisory Boards and Commissions of the city)
- Verification of degree by an accredited agency recognized by the U.S. Department of Education (for any position requiring a degree)
- Safety Sensitive Random Drug and Alcohol Testing Program Designation Form
- U.S. Department of Transportation Regulations (DOT) Designation Form
- Offer Letter/Packet (for Appointed Employees/Officials Only)
- Confirmation Resolution for Appointed Officials
- Veteran Information Form

NEW HIRE ATTACHMENT CHECKLIST (cont'd)

Name _____

Organization (Index Code) _____ Hire Date _____

ADDITIONAL FORMS - DO NOT SCAN WITH E-HR

- W-4, Federal Tax Withholding form must be completed and forwarded to the city's Payroll Office for all newly-hired personnel. The W-4 is not a part of the personnel file. -Do not attach to new hire paperwork.
- Direct Deposit forms are located on the City of Jacksonville (COJ) Portal, Accounting Link Category: Payroll. Send forms and account information directly to the city's Payroll Office - Do not attach to new hire paperwork.
- Consent For Drug and/or Alcohol Testing of a Minor Child - Do Not Attach to new hire paperwork. Please send this completed form to Human Resources, ATTN: Talent Acquisition (Medical Desk), City Hall, Suite 100.

The purpose of this checklist is as an aide to the initiator performing the New Hire Process, therefore, it should not be scanned into the New Hire transaction. Dispose of this checklist at the completion of the hiring process.