

HISTORIC PRESERVATION
COMMISSION

Proceedings held on Wednesday, November 15, 2023,
commencing at 3:00 p.m., at Jacksonville City Hall, Lynwood Roberts Room, 117 West Duval Street,


Notary Public in and for the State of Florida at Large.

PRESENT:
JACK C. DEMETREE, III, Chairman.
ANDRES LOPERA, Vice Chair.
JULIA EPSTEIN, Secretary.
OLIVIA FRICK, Commission Member.
MICHAEL MONTOYA, Commission Member.
ALSO PRESENT:
ARIMUS WELLS, Planning and Development Dept.
JERMAINE ANDERSON, Planning and Development.
CARLA LOPERA, Office of General Counsel.

Diane M. Tropia, Ine., post Offiee Box 2375, Jacksonville, Fblo 32203 (904) 821-0300

PROCEEDINGS
November 15, 2023 3:00 p.m.

2

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We're going to go ahead and start the November 15th meeting of the Jacksonville Historic Preservation Commission.

If I could start with some introductions, please.

MR. WELLS: Arimus Wells, Historic Preservation.

MS. LOPERA: Carla Lopera, Office of General Counsel.

COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: Michael Montoya, commissioner.

THE CHAIRMAN: J.C. Demetree, chairman.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Andres Lopera, commissioner.

COMMISSIONER EPSTEIN: Julia Epstein, commissioner.

COMMISSIONER FRICK: Olivia Frick, commissioner.

THE CHAIRMAN: We're going to take a break every two hours, if needed. If you would please silence your cell phones. And any private conversations, please be had in the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
hallway.
And, with that, I'll entertain a motion for the October 25th minutes.

COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: Motion to approve the minutes.

COMMISSIONER EPSTEIN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Those opposed?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Hearing none, we're going to move right in, Section B, our deferred items. We have COA-22-27451, 2768 Riverside Avenue; COA-23-28339, 3664 Richmond Street; COA-23-29186, 2799 Selma Street; COA-23-29765, 1971 Phoenix Avenue; COA-23-29813, 3873 Jean Street; and LS-23-01, 0 Ellis Road South.

All are deferred.
And, with that, we'll pop straight into our consent agenda.

Do any commissioners have any ex parte or anything they want to pull off that?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Hearing none, we're in Section C, our consent agenda. We

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
have COA-23-29848, 0 11th Street West; COA-23-29850, 145 11th Street West; COA-23-29868, 2861 College Street;
COA-23-29747, 1290 Edgewood Avenue South.
And that is it on consent.
I'm going to go ahead and open the public hearing.

Is anybody here to speak on anything on the consent agenda?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Seeing none, I'll close the public hearing, and I'll entertain a motion.

COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Motion to approve the consent agenda.

COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: Comments, concerns?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Those opposed?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Hearing none, the consent agenda has been approved.

I just want to be clear, if anybody was
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
here for any of those items and they were your
2
items, they have been approved and you're welcome to leave. Just FYI.

All right. We're going to just go straight forward to Section G, Certificates of Appropriateness. We have COA-23-29525, 1272 Edgewood Avenue South.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
So --
THE CHAIRMAN: Give me one second. We're going to have a quick staff report.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Okay. Sorry.
THE CHAIRMAN: No, you're fine.
MR. WELLS: Okay. So this is application COA-23-29525 for the property located at 1272 Edgewood Avenue South.

This is a request to demolish a noncontributing, detached, one-story garage, and construct a new detached, two-story garage in a contributing property within the Riverside Avondale Historic District.

As proposed, the applicant is seeking to demolish the existing structure and propose a two-story garage that will have a brick veneer

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
front elevation, fiber cement lap siding on the remaining elevations, 6-over-1 windows, a hip shingled roof, exterior stairs, two pedestrian doors and two garage doors.

Overall, staff is in support of the new construction. However, we did -- you'll notice on Page 173 of the book, staff did have a list of comments that we wanted the applicant to incorporate within her -- their overall design.

Overall, the applicant has complied with those with the exception of Condition Number 9 in the staff report. So this references additional windows shall be added to the left elevation. So I believe that's what the applicant is here to speak on.

But other than that, we recommend approval with conditions.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Questions for staff?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. We'll open the public hearing.

And you can come on up.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
AUDIENCE MEMBER: So there were two
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
items --
THE CHAIRMAN: If you'll do me a favor, state your name and address.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Kathy Olesen, 1272
Edgewood Avenue South.
THE CHAIRMAN: Kathy, she's going to swear you in real quick.

THE REPORTER: If you would raise your right hand for me, please.

MS. OLESEN: (Complies.)
THE REPORTER: Do you affirm that the testimony you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

MS. OLESEN: I do.
THE REPORTER: Thank you.
MS. OLESEN: Okay. So there were two conditions that I wanted to discuss. One of them was Number 7, which is the brick veneer; and Number 9 , which were the additional windows.

On the brick veneer, the current structure does not have a brick veneer at all. It is a simple wood structure with cedar shakes on it, and I'd like to be able to do that with the new

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
structure as well.
I do have pictures and so forth of the neighborhood where the other garages are also wood-sided garages, so it would be similar to what's already in existence.

On Number 9, it is really just the two windows on the bottom floor, which would be to the left. I had asked to not put windows there. It faces a fence, so it's not viewable from the street at all. And there would be two windows on the top, which is fine, but the fence is about 3 feet away, and there's nothing to see, really.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Questions for our applicant?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We'll call you back up if we need you.

MS. OLESEN: Thank you.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
All right. Is anybody else here to speak on this COA?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, we'll close the public hearing, and I'll entertain a

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
motion.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Motion to approve COA-23-29525 with staff conditions. COMMISSIONER EPSTEIN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Let's chat.
I mean, off the bat, I don't think I have a problem with the -- with the windows, especially if we're doing two up top. And it's
3 feet from the fence and not visible from the street.

Unless anybody else has thoughts on that ...

COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: No, I concur with that. I agree with that.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: And, through the Chair, regarding Condition 7, I'm okay with it being wood siding all the way around. I don't think that adding brick veneer off the (inaudible) elevation is going to make a lot of difference, so -- and also considering the original structure was also wood siding or some kind of siding, I'm okay with it not matching.

THE CHAIRMAN: I would agree.
COMMISSIONER EPSTEIN: Through the Chair,
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

10
I agree with that. And looking at this front elevation, too, this large tree, that it will be blocking a good portion of it.

I think -- I know we like our new structures not to exactly always resemble the new -- the existing structures, so -- and it even looks -- like you're saying, there's wood siding on there right now, so I'm good with that.

COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: The only other -through the Chair, the only other comment I would add is a question to staff about perhaps visiting this in the design guidelines because I think the applicant makes a good point about the secondary structure historically not always matching the material of the main structure, especially if it was brick.

The secondary structure is like garages and even carriage houses. I think there is definitely a historic precedent for those to be of a -- of a wood material rather than a masonry material, so I think that's something we might revisit or -- or look at in the design guidelines.

THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We have a
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
motion on the table that is not addressed.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Motion to amend striking Condition 7. And on Condition 9, amending Condition 9 that the windows are only to be added to the second level and not the first level -- the left elevation.

COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All those in favor?
MS. LOPERA: Can we --
THE CHAIRMAN: Sorry.
I'm assuming you want a limit, correct, on the -- for striking Number 7; is that where we're going?

MS. LOPERA: I just wanted to confer -through the Chair, I wanted to confer with staff on one item.
(Ms. Lopera confers with Mr. Wells.)
THE CHAIRMAN: I was going to say, do you want to list out what the secondary structure can be instead of just amending Number 7, or --
(Simultaneous speaking.)
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Condition 3 says (inaudible).

THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah, I guess that covers it. Okay.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

MS. LOPERA: Through the Chair to the Commission, my only question would be about Condition 9. So on the second level, you're asking to add a second window, and then no additional windows on the first floor, correct?

THE CHAIRMAN: Correct.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: That's correct.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. With that, all those in favor?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Those opposed?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: And we'll vote on the motion as amended.

All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Those opposed?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Hearing none, you have approved COA-23-29525.

And we will move right along.
Let's see. Section K, public comment. Do we have any public comment today?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. With that,
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

1 New Business, Number 1, a road renaming, 2 Section L.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

14

MR. WELLS: Okay. So we have a road renaming to rename Confederate Street to Ben Frazier Street. So pursuant to Chapter 745 of the Jacksonville Ordinance Code, requests to rename streets require a review and recommendation from the Historic Preservation Commission. So making this recommendation, the Commission shall address the six aforementioned criteria within the report itself.

So in terms of the nature of the request, the request is to honor the life and legacy of Jacksonville native and civil rights advocate Benjamin, or Ben, Frazier. The change would rename the entire portion of Confederate Street, between Hubbard Street and North Liberty Street.

So prior to being named Confederate Street, the subject street was originally named Park Terrace. However, in 1926, it was renamed to Confederate Street. And although it cannot be definitively confirm by staff, it is widely speculated that Park Terrace was renamed to Confederate Street due to its proximity to

Confederate Park, which was renamed to Springfield Park in 2020. So there's a typo in the report, but it should be 2020.

So after opening in 1907, Confederate Park was originally named Dignan Park, but it wasn't until after 1914, when the United Confederate Veterans celebrated their 24th annual reunion of the park, in which they had the City rename the park to Confederate Park.

While several historic structures have frontage along this portion of the subject street, none of the structures have addresses under Confederate Street, and the street name is also not part of a common theme of street names in the area, nor is it a duplicate street name.

So based on the best evidence available, the Department does not have an objection to the proposed street name change, and we forward you our comments herein.

THE CHAIRMAN: Any questions for staff?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. We'll open the public hearing.

Is the applicant here? We don't have an
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
applicant?
MR. WELLS: No. This is being sponsored by Council Member Peluso.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Is anybody here to speak on this by chance?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. I'll close the public hearing.

I guess I'll entertain a motion.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Motion to recommend for approval, road renaming of Confederate Street to Ben Frazier Street.

COMMISSIONER EPSTEIN: Second. THE CHAIRMAN: All those in favor? COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Those opposed?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Hearing none, you have recommended approval, and we'll move on to Number 2, Historic Preservation Section window supplement.

MR. WELLS: That is deferred. No report.
THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, deferred. Correct.
Okay. Number 3, New Business, 2024
Certificate of Appropriateness application
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
matrix.
MR. WELLS: All right. So this is just on the agenda again. Last month we introduced some draft changes that we would like to incorporate into the next iteration of the COA matrix. Overall, the changes have not -nothing has changed since last month with the exception of Number 29 on the matrix. So this is for temporary structures. We did strike the time limitation, pursuant to the administrative matrix -- or administrative review versus Commission review to just allow staff some more flexibility.

One thing we saw over the past, especially during the summer, is damage that occurred to a school that was connected to a church and they needed time to rebuild their -- their structure, and so they had to replace temporary trailers which would require more than 30 days, so we just want a little bit more time to allow them to make those changes.

But other than that, in its current fashion, nothing else has changed, and we would certainly welcome a motion to approve the red line changes and be on our way to forward a new

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

1 matrix.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Through the Chair, since staff didn't give me many COAs to review this time around, I kind of focused my critical efforts on the matrix.

One, for the accessibility ramp, that should read "finished floor elevation up to 3 feet tall," or I would like that to read "finished floor elevation."

And the same for Number 3, Decks and Balconies, that the finished floor of the deck should -- up to 4 feet above grade.

MR. WELLS: Okay.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: And one more quick comment on solar panels. Which one is that?

MR. WELLS: Under roofs? So Number 9, Page 3.

COMMISSIONER LOPERA: That should read -under Skylights.

MR. WELLS: Skylights?
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Up to -- less than
6 inches above the roof plane.
MR. WELLS: Above the roof plane.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: That was all.
Thank you.
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

Commissioner Montoya --
COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: In light of Commissioner Lopera's actions, I'd like to say that I, too, will heavily review the matrix for the next meeting.

THE CHAIRMAN: Well, I think we're going
to vote to approve it today, so --
Okay. Is this a public hearing for this?
It can be? Does it have to be?
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: You can take public comment.

THE CHAIRMAN: I'll open the public hearing.

Is anyone here to speak on the matrix by chance?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Indicating.)
THE CHAIRMAN: Come on up.
(Audience member approaches the podium.)
THE CHAIRMAN: If you'll state your name and address.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: William Hoff, 1402 North Laura Street, 32206.

Okay. Good afternoon. So I'm here speaking on behalf of SPAR.

I had a quick question on Page 3, when it
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
speaks about roofs in the general section.
There is a bullet point that's specifically about Springfield, and it talks about installing new metal roofs on frame vernaculars or replacing metal roofs with a gray composition shingle. I had a question as to why that was Springfield specific, I guess.

MR. WELLS: Yeah, so this is -- that particular clause was a carryover from the previous administrative matrix. And so from my understanding, that was something that was worked out amongst the Commission staff as well as SPAR as to allow more flexibility for metal roofs because that was the predominant -- or a very common roof form within this district. So to allow for replacement with something that was similar, in color at least, for composition shingles.

So that's where it originated from. We just kept it. We carried it over.

MR. HOFF: Gotcha.
So do you have any knowledge about why that is only for Springfield and not for Riverside/Avondale?

MR. WELLS: From my understanding, it's
Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
because Springfield does have more of a predominance of metal roofs as opposed to Riverside.

MR. HOFF: Gotcha.
Okay. And then I did want to share one comment that Shannon Blankenship, the executive director of RAP, wanted to share. She sent in a question and a comment, I think, late, and she was not able to be here or this afternoon.

So this comment is from her and RAP. She says, "Thank you for sharing the proposed changes to the matrix as a part of tonight's agenda. Just two comments on Page 5."

And the change that she is referring to is regarding windows, administrative, where "not readily street visible" has been crossed out or red lined out. So her, I guess, concern about this is that -- she mentioned that -- how that reads afterwards is vague and difficult to enforce. That would read, "window alterations that are reasonably compatible with the structure." So her concern, I guess, is that that's vague and that that's hard to enforce.

And then her one other comment was about wholesale replacement of historic windows being

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
removed from the JHPC, and she's not sure where
that goes. Her question is, quote, "You're adding replacement of historic windows with a vinyl material in the same section. Is that meant to cover wholesale window replacement?"

I'm not sure if you followed that, but --
MR. WELLS: Yeah. In terms of your last question, or the last comment that Shannon made, yes, that -- the new red line on the Commission side for contributing structure replacement, yeah, that -- that's supposed to replace the strike-through, also replacement of historic windows. So in lieu of that, it would be replacement of historic windows with a vinyl material.

MR. HOFF: Gotcha.
All right. I think that's it.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
Is anybody else here to speak on the matrix?

AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. With that, we'll close the public hearing.

And, let's see, I'll take a vote to approve.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

MS. LOPERA: So through the Chair to the Commission, I think you've made a few amendments -- Commissioner Lopera has made a few amendments to the matrix. So if you could -- if somebody wants to make a motion to approve and state those changes with the --

THE CHAIRMAN: It sounds like a --
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: It sounds like a job for me.

THE CHAIRMAN: It sounds like a you motion, yes.

COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Through the Chair, so do I have to restate those all over again?

MS. LOPERA: Yes.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Can I just have the record read back?

MS. LOPERA: No.
THE CHAIRMAN: It doesn't work like that.
COMMISSIONER LOPERA: Then motion to amend the 2023 COA matrix criteria, Item Number 1, Accessibility Ramps, amend that to read --
under the size of that, to read, "Finished
floor elevation up to 3 feet tall."
Number 3, Decks and Balconies, amend the size to read, "Finished floor elevation of the

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
decks up to 4 feet above grade."
Item Number 9, Roofs, under Skylights, amend the size to read, "Less than 6 inches above the roof plane."

That's all.
COMMISSIONER EPSTEIN: Second.
THE CHAIRMAN: All those in favor?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
THE CHAIRMAN: Those opposed?
COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: So now I can --
MS. LOPERA: So that was the final vote on that because you voted to approve it with some changes --

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So we're good.
MS. LOPERA: -- as stated by Commissioner Lopera.

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So we will move right along.

Section M, Information, Pending
Legislation, or litigation, as I said last time.

MR. WELLS: All right. So just a little preface here, but -- again, this is something that I want to start getting in the habit of

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300
doing for the Commission, essentially, just updating you all about pending legislative matters that pertain to historic preservation, just making you all aware of what's moving through City Council.

So, again, we have two landmarks going.
So we have the first one, which is 2023-0700.
So this is the 3239 Dellwood Avenue property,
a/k/a Elvis. It's going to the Land Use and
Zoning Committee of City Council on
November 21st.
And then the second one is the Arlington Federal Loans and Savings [sic] building, so that's going to the Land Use and Zoning Committee on December 5th.

And then the next three ordinances -- so this is $-0717,-0718$, and -0719-- they are for ad valorem property tax exemptions. And so this is something that's done internally with staff, so you don't really get any interface here, but ultimately it's going to two different public hearings. So the first one is with the Neighborhoods Committee [sic], and that's on November 20th. And the second one is the Finance Committee, which is on

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

1 November 21st.
And on the second page, we have some -- we have two pending ordinances. So the first one is an appeal. So we -- you all, as a Commission, voted to recommend denial of a COA for an after-the-fact wholesale window replacement last month, so the applicants have decided to do an appeal route. So that will be coming through the pipeline, through City Council.

And then the second one, which recently was just introduced to City Council last night, so this is Ordinance 2023-0396. This is for another landmark, so this is the 411 North Liberty Street property, so that will be going to the Land Use and Zoning Committee on January 3rd of next year, so --

Again, besides just updating you all, this is an opportunity for you all to participate if you deem so, but, again, I just want to get in the habit of doing that.

That's the report.
THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: Through the Chair, just a question for staff.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

26

On the -- I'm just curious about -- do you have any other information about -17, -18, -19, or just letting us know?

MR. WELLS: Through the Chair to Commissioner Montoya, we do have a bill summary, so that's on the next couple of pages of the book. But if you do want more details, I can give you that.

But, essentially, these are commercial buildings that are all owned by JWB. They're doing some improvements, so -- the way the ad valorem tax exemption works is -- they're doing -- they're seeking an exemption on the qualified improvements that they make within the building itself, so -- it's just a ten-year deferment on taxes, essentially.

COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: Okay.
MR. WELLS: But there's a bill summary included within the book that goes into more details.

COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: Okay. I'm not familiar with the other two, but the 510 Julia Street, I know, is a Klutho building, the Porter Mansion, so that one is a significant (inaudible) --

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300
(Reporter clarification.) COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: I'm so sorry.
I said, I'm not familiar with the other two, but the one on 510 Julia Street is the Porter Mansion that was designed by Klutho, so it's of historic value to (inaudible).

THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Public Works.
MR. WELLS: Deferred. No report.
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, unless anyone has anything else --

COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: One thing -THE CHAIRMAN: Please. COMMISSIONER MONTOYA: Just one thing. When we're reviewing the matrix -- it wasn't part of it, but I know that in previous hearings -- or meetings, rather, we have had discussion about new windows being installed in existing historic structures, primarily residential, where there was a dispute about the plane of the window and the glass surface being more flush with the envelope of the building as opposed to -- in difference to the historic windows, which tend to have a more punched opening in the envelope and the plane of the glass being more recessed.

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

And we haven't discussed it at length, but I think this is something I want on record as being considered for either discussion or in review of the matrix, future matrix revisions, because I -- I understand that, the way buildings are made now and the way new windows are installed, there's a -- there's a logic to the way that the glass is situated relative to the jam and the head and the sill.

And Commissioner Epstein mentioned it earlier, about new construction not imitating historic structures. I think there's an argument for some difference in the -- in that regard because of the efficiency -- the energy efficiency that new windows provide. So I think that just needs to be something that's discussed.

It's especially in consideration of new construction on historic sites where they're all new windows and there's no comparison of the new windows to the historic windows. Most people, when they build a new house, they want to use the most efficient materials and assemblies that they can use, and so I think that's a valid argument that should be

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

## discussed.

THE CHAIRMAN: I agree.
All right. Does anybody else have anything else?

COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, with that, we are adjourned.
(The foregoing proceedings were adjourned at 3:30 p.m.)

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

2
3 STATE OF FLORIDA)
)
COUNTY OF DUVAL )

I, Diane M. Tropia, Florida Professional Reporter, certify that I was authorized to and did stenographically report the foregoing proceedings and that the transcript is a true and complete record of my stenographic notes.

DATED this 26th day of November 2023.

Diane M. Tropia
Florida Professional Reporter

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., Post Office Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203 (904) 821-0300

| 0 | 3rd [1] - 25:17 | $18: 23,20: 9$ | $3: 16,4: 4,5: 7,5: 17$ $7: 5,24: 8$ | 12:1, 17:2, 22:1, |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0 [2] - 3:17, 4:1 | 4 | agenda [7] - 3:20 | Avondale [1] - 5:22 | CHAIRMAN [65] - 2 : |
| 0717 [1] - 24:17 |  | 25, 4:9, 4:15, 4:24, | aware [1] - $24:$ | 2:15, 2:22, 3:7, 3: |
| 0718 [1] - 24:17 | 4[2]-17:12, 23:1 | :3, 20:13 | aye [6]-3:8, 4:20 | 1, 3:24, 4:11, |
| 0719 [1] - 24:17 | 411 [1]-25:14 | $\begin{gathered} \text { agree }[4]-9: 14,9: 24, \\ 10: 1,29: 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 12: 10,12: 16,15: 15, \\ & 23 \cdot 8 \end{aligned}$ | $4: 17,4: 19,4: 21$ |
|  |  | ahead [2]-2:4, 4:6 |  | $6: 18,6: 21,7: 2,7: 6$ |
|  |  | allow [4] - 16:12, | B | 4, 8:17, 8 |
| $\begin{aligned} & 1[2]-13: 1,22: 20 \\ & 117[1]-1: 8 \\ & \text { 11th }[2]-4: 1,4: 2 \\ & 1272[3]-5: 6,5: 16, \\ & 7: 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathbf{5}_{[1]}-20: 13 \\ & \mathbf{5 1 0}_{[2]}-26: 22,27: 4 \\ & \mathbf{5 t h}_{[1]}-24: 15 \end{aligned}$ | 16:20, 19:13, 19:16 |  | 8:24, 9:5, 9:15, 9:24, |
|  |  |  | Balconies [2]-17:11, | 10:25, 11:8, 11:10, |
|  |  | ALSO [1] - 1:16 alterations [1] - 20:20 | $22: 24$ | $11: 18,11: 24,12: 6,$ |
|  |  | amend [5] - 11:2, | $\begin{aligned} & \text { based [1]-14:17 } \\ & \text { bat [1] }-9: 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 12: 8,12: 11,12: 13 \\ & 12: 17,12: 19,12: 25 \end{aligned}$ |
| 1290 [1]-4:4 |  | $23: 3$ | behalf [1] - 18:24 | 14:21, 14:23, 15:4, |
| 1402 [1]-18:21 | $\begin{aligned} & 6[2]-17: 22,23: 3 \\ & 6 \text {-over-1 [1] }-6: 2 \end{aligned}$ | amended [1] - 12:14 | Ben [3]-13:5, 13:15, | 15:7, 15:14, 15:16, |
| 145 [1] - 4:2 |  | amending [2] - 11:4, |  | $15: 18,15: 23,18: 6,$ |
| 15 [2]-1:6, 2:1 |  | 11:20 <br> amendments [2] - | Benjamin [1]-13:15 $\text { best }[1]-14: 17$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 18:12, 18:17, 18:19, } \\ & \text { 21:18, 21:22, 22:7 } \end{aligned}$ |
| 15th [1] - 2:4 |  |  | between [1] - 13:17 | 21:18, 21:22, 22:7, 22:10, 22:18, 23:7, |
| 17 [1]-26:2 | 7 [5] - 7:19, 9 | amendments [2]- $22: 3,22: 4$ | between [1] - 13:17 | 23:9, 23:11, 23:15, |
| 173 [1]-6:7 18 | 11:12, 11:20 | ANDERSON [1] - 1:18 | bill [2] - 26:5, 26:18 | 23:18, 25:23, 27:7, |
| 18 [1]-26:2 | 745 [1] - 13:5 | Andres [1] - 2:16 | bit [1] - 16:20 | 27:9, 27:12, 29:2, |
| $1907 \text { [1] - 14:4 }$ |  | ANDRES ${ }_{[1]}-1: 13$ <br> annual [1] - 14:7 <br> appeal [2] - 25:4, 25:8 <br> applicant [8]-5:23, | blocking [1] - 10:3 book [3] - 6:7, 26:7 | 29:6 |
| 1914 [1] - 14:6 |  |  |  | Chairman [1] - 1:13 |
| 1926 [1] - 13:21 | $\begin{aligned} & 9[8]-6: 11,7: 20,8: 6, \\ & 11: 3,11: 4,12: 3, \\ & 17: 16,23: 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 6: 8,6: 10,6: 15,8: 15 \\ 10: 14,14: 25,15: 1 \\ \text { applicants [1] - } 25: 7 \end{gathered}$ | 26:19 <br> bottom [1] - 8:7 <br> break [1]-2:22 <br> brick [6] - 5:25, 7:19, | chance [2] - 15:5, |
| 1971 [1]-3:16 |  |  |  | 18:15 |
| 2 |  |  |  | change [3]-13:15, |
| 2 [1]-15:20 | A | application [2]-5:15, $15: 25$ | 7:22, 7:23, 9:19, 10:17 | changed [2] - 16:7, |
| 2020 [2]-14:2, 14:3 | $\mathbf{a / k} / \mathbf{a}$ [1] - 24:9 | approaches [3] - 5:8,$6: 24,18: 18$ | build [1] - 28:2 | 16:23 |
| $2023[4]-1: 6,2: 1$ | $\text { able [2] }-7: 25,2$ |  | $26: 15,26: 23,27: 22$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { changes }[7]-16: 4, \\ 16: 6,16: 21,16: 25, \end{gathered}$ |
| $22: 20,30: 15$ | accessibility [1]-17:6 | Appropriateness [2] - | 26:15, 26:23, 27:22 | $16: 6,16: 21,16: 25$ $20: 12,22: 6,23: 14$ |
| 2023-0396 [1] - 25:13 | Accessibility [1] - | $5: 6,15: 25$ | buildings [2]-26:10, $28: 6$ | Chapter [1] - 13:5 |
| 2023-0700 [1] - 24:7 | 22:21 | approval [3]-6:16, | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 28:6 } \\ & \text { bullet }[1]-19: 2 \\ & \text { Business }[2]-13: 1 \text {, } \\ & \text { 15:24 } \end{aligned}$ | chat [1] - 9:5 |
| 2024 [1] - 15:24 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ad }[2]-24: 18,26: 12 \\ & \text { add }[2]-10: 12,12: 4 \\ & \text { added }[2]-6: 13,11: 5 \end{aligned}$ | $15: 11,15: 19$ |  | chat [1] - 9:5 <br> church [1]-16:16 |
| 20th [1] - 24:24 |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { approve }[8]-3: 4, \\ 4: 14,9: 2,16: 24, \\ 18: 7,21: 25,22: 6, \end{gathered}$ |  | CITY [1] - 1:1 |
| 21st [2] - $24: 11,25: 1$ 24th |  |  |  | City [6] - 1:7, 14:8, |
| 24th [1] - 14:7 |  | $23: 13$ | C |  |
| 25th [1]-3:3 | adding [2] - 9:19, 21:3 |  |  | $25: 12$ |
| 26th [1] - 30:15 | additional [3]-6:13, | approved [3] - 4:24, |  |  |
| $2768[1]-3: 13$ | $7: 20,12: 5$ | $5: 2,12: 20$ | cannot $[1]-13: 22$ civil $[1]-13: 14$ <br> CARLA  <br> clarification $[1]-27: 18$  |  |
| 2799 [1]-3:15 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 13:10, 18:20 } \\ & \text { addressed [1] - 11:1 } \\ & \text { addresses [1] - 14:12 } \end{aligned}$ | argument [2]-28:13,28:25 | (1] 1.18 <br> clause [1] - 19:9 |  |
| 2861[1]-4:3 |  |  | carriage [1] - 10:19 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { clear }[1]-4: 25 \\ & \text { close }[4]-4: 12,8: 24, \\ & 15: 7,21: 23 \end{aligned}$ |
| 29 [1] - 16:8 |  | 28:25 <br> ARIMUS [1]-1:17 | carried [1] - 19:20 |  |
| 3 |  | ARIMUS [1] - 1:17 <br> Arimus [1]-2:9 <br> Arlington [1] - 24:12 | carried [1] - 19:20 carryover [1] - 19:9 |  |
|  |  |  | cedar [1]-7:24 | COA [4]-8:22, 16:5, |
| 3 101 - 8.12 9.9 | administrative [4] | assemblies [1] - 28:24 | celebrated [1] - 14:7 | 22:20, 25:5 |
| 11:22, 15:24, 17:8, | 16:10, 16:11, 19:10, | assuming [1] - 11:11 | cell [1]-2:24 <br> cement [1] - 6:1 | COA-22-27451 [1] - |
| 17:10, 17:17, 18:25, |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { AUDIENCE [11] - 4:10, } \\ 5: 9,5: 13,6: 25,7: 4, \end{gathered}$ |  | $3: 13$ |
| 22:23, 22:24 | 20:15 |  | certainly [1] - 16:24 | COA-23-28339 [1] - |
| 30 [1] - 16:19 | affirm [1] - 7:11 <br> aforementioned [1] - | $\begin{aligned} & 8: 23,12: 24,15: 6 \\ & 18: 16,18: 21,21: 21 \end{aligned}$ | CERTIFICATE [1] - | 3:14 |
| 32206 [1] - 18:22 |  |  | 30:1 | COA-23-29186 [1] - |
| 3239 [1]-24:8 | $13: 10$ | Audience [3] - 5:8,$6: 24,18: 18$ | Certificate [1] - 15:25 | 3:15 |
| 3664 [1]-3:14 | ```after-the-fact [1] - 25:6 afternoon [3]-5:9,``` |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Certificates }[1]-5: 5 \\ & \text { certify }[1]-30: 8 \\ & \text { Chair }[11]-1: 13,9: 17, \\ & 9: 25,10: 11,11: 15, \end{aligned}$ | COA-23-29525 [4] - |
| 3873 [1]-3:16 |  | authorized [1] - 30:8 <br> available [1] - 14:17 <br> Avenue [7]-3:14, |  | 5:6, 5:16, 9:3, 12:20 |
| 3:00 [2] - 1:7, 2:1 |  |  |  | COA-23-29747 [1] - |
| 3:30 [1] - 29:9 |  |  |  | 4:4 |


| $\begin{aligned} & \text { COA-23-29765[1] - } \\ & 3: 15 \\ & \text { COA-23-29813 [1] - } \\ & 3: 16 \end{aligned}$ | 19:15 <br> comparison [1] - | 16:22 | Duval ${ }_{[1]}-1: 8$ <br> DUVAL [1] - 30:4 | 12:15, 15:14, 23:7 <br> Federal [1]-24:13 <br> feet [6] - 8:12, 9:9, |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | D |  |  |
|  | patible [1] - 20:21 |  |  | 22:23, |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { COA-23-29848 [1] - } \\ & 4: 1 \end{aligned}$ | complete [1]-30:10 <br> complied [1]-6:10 | damage [1] - 16:15 <br> DATED [1] - 30:15 |  |  |
|  |  |  | Ed | 3] - 8:9, 8:1 |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { COA-23-29850 } \\ & \text { [1] }- \end{aligned}$ | Complies [1]-7:10 composition [2] - | days [1] - 16:19 | 7, 5:17, 7:5 | 9:9 |
|  |  | December [1] - 24:1 | efficiency [2]-28:14 | few [2]-22:2, 22: |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { COA-23-29868 [1] - } \\ & 4: 3 \end{aligned}$ | ```composition [2] - 19:6, 19:17 concern [2]-20:17,``` | 25: | 28:15 | fiber [1] - 6: |
|  |  | de | efficient $\left.{ }^{1]}\right]$ - 28:23 | final [1] - 23:12 |
| COAs [1] - 17:3 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { concern [2]-20:17, } \\ & \text { 20:22 } \end{aligned}$ | de | forts [1] - 17 | Finance [1] - 24:25 |
| Code [1] - 13:6 <br> College [1]-4:3 <br> color [1] - 19:17 <br> coming [1] - 25:9 <br> commencing [1] - 1:7 | concerns [1]-4:17 <br> concur [1]-9:13 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Decks [2] - 17:10, } \\ & \text { 22:24 } \end{aligned}$ | either [1]-28:3 | fine ${ }_{[2]}-5: 14,8: 11$ |
|  |  |  | elevation [9] - 6:1 | finished [3]-17:7, |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Condition }[7]-6: 11 \text {, } \\ & 9: 17,11: 3,11: 4, \\ & 11: 22,12: 3 \end{aligned}$ | deem [1]-25:20 <br> deferment ${ }^{[1]}$ - 26:16 | 6:14, 9:20, 10:2, | 17:9, 17:11 |
|  |  |  | 11:6, 17:7, 17:9 | Finished [2]-22:22 |
|  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { deferred }[5]-3: 12, \\ & 3: 18,15: 22,15: 23, \\ & 27: 8 \end{aligned}$ | 22:23, 22:25 | 2:2 |
| comment [10]-10:11, | conditions [3]-6:17, $7: 18,9: 3$ |  | elevations [1]-6:2 | first [5] - 11:6, 12:5, |
| 11, 20:6, 20:8 | Confederate [11] -13:4, 13:16, 13:19, | definitely [1] - 10:20 definitively [1] - 13:23 | Elvis [1] - 24:9 energy [1] - 28:14 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { flexibility [2] - 16:13, } \\ & \text { 19:13 } \end{aligned}$ |
| 20:10, 20:24, 21:8 |  |  |  |  |
| $\begin{gathered} \text { comments [4]-4:17, } \\ 6: 8,14: 20,20: 13 \\ \text { commercial }[1]-26: 9 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 13:22, 13:25, 14:1, } \\ & \text { 14:4, 14:6, 14:9, } \\ & 14: 13,15: 11 \end{aligned}$ | Dellwood [1] - 24:8 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { enforce }[2]-20: 20 \text {, } \\ & 20: 23 \end{aligned}$ | floor [7] - 8:7, 12:5, |
|  |  | Demetree [1] - 2:15 |  | 17:7, 17:9, 17:11, |
|  |  | DEMETREE ${ }_{[1]}-1: 13$ <br> demolish [2]-5:18, | entertain [4]-3:2, | 23, 22:2 |
| COMMISSION [19] - <br> $1 \cdot 3,3 \cdot 8,3 \cdot 10,3 \cdot 23$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 14:13, 15:11 } \\ \text { confer [2] - 11:14, } \end{gathered}$ |  | 4:13, 8:25, 15: | FLORIDA [1] - 30:3 |
|  | 11:15 | 5:24 | entire [1]-13:16 <br> envelope [2]-27:21, | Florida [4]-1:9, 1:10,$30: 7,30: 18$ |
| 4:18, 4:20, 4:22, | confers [1] - 11:17 confirm [1] - 13:23 |  |  |  |
| 6:20, 8:16, 12:10 |  | denial ${ }_{[1]}-25: 5$ | envelope [2]-27:21, $27: 24$ | 30:7, 30:18 flush [1]-27:21 |
| 12:12, 12:16, 12:18, | connected [1]-16:16 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Department }{ }_{[1]} \text { - } \\ & 14: 18 \end{aligned}$ | EPSTEIN $[7]-1: 14$,$2: 18,3: 6,9: 4,9: 25$, | focused [1] - 17:4 |
| 14:22, 15:15, 15:17, | consent [6]-3:20, | Dept [1] - 1:17 |  | followed [1] - 21:6 <br> foregoing [2]-29:8, |
| 23:8, 23:10, 29:5 | 2, 4:5, 4:9, 4:15 | design [3]-6:9 | $\begin{aligned} & 2: 18,3: 6,9: 4,9: 25, \\ & 15: 13,23: 6 \end{aligned}$ |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Commission }_{[12]}- \\ & 1: 14,1: 15,2: 6,12: 2, \\ & 13: 9,13: 10,16: 12, \\ & 19: 12,21: 10,22: 2, \\ & 24: 1,25: 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 4:23 } \\ & \text { consideration }[1] \text { - } \end{aligned}$ | designed [1]-27:5 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Epstein [2]-2:18, } \\ & \text { 28:10 } \end{aligned}$ | 30:9 <br> form [1]-19:15 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 28:18 } \\ & \text { considered }[1]-28: 3 \end{aligned}$ | detached [2]-5:19, 5:20 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { especially }[4]-9: 8, \\ & 10: 17,16: 14,28: 18 \end{aligned}$ | form [1] - 19:15 |
|  |  |  |  | forward [3]-5: |
|  | considering [1] - 9:21 | [2]-26:7 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { essentially }[3]-24: 1 \text {, } \\ & 26: 9,26: 16 \end{aligned}$ | 19, 16:25 |
| COMMISSIONER [38] | construct [1] - 5:20 | 26:20 |  |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & -2: 13,2: 16,2: 18, \\ & 2: 20,3: 4,3: 6,4: 14, \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Development }{ }^{[2]} \text { - } \\ & \text { 1:17, 1:18 } \end{aligned}$ | evidence [1] - 14:17 <br> ex [1] - 3:21 | rame [1] - 19:4 |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { construction }[3]-6: 6, \\ & 28: 11,28: 19 \end{aligned}$ |  |  | Frazier [3]-13: |
| 4:16, 9:2, 9:4, 9:13, | contributing [2] | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Diane }[3]-1: 9,30: 7, \\ & 30: 18 \end{aligned}$ | exactly ${ }^{[1]}-10: 5$ | 13:15, 15:12 |
| 9:16, 9:25, 10:10, |  |  |  | Frick [1] - 2:20 |
| 11:2, 11:7, 11:22, | conversations [1] - | $\begin{aligned} & \text { difference }[3]-9: 21, \\ & 27: 22,28: 13 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 16:8 } \\ & \text { executive }[1]-20: 6 \end{aligned}$ | FRICK $[2]-1: 14,2: 20$front ${ }_{[2]}-6: 1,10: 1$ |
| 12:7, 15:10, 15:13, |  |  |  |  |
| 17:2, 17:14, 17:18, | correct [5] - 11:11 | different [1]-24:22 <br> difficult [1]-20:19 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { exemption [2]-26:12, } \\ & 26: 13 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { frontage }{ }_{[1]}-14: 11 \\ & \text { future }[1]-28: 4 \\ & \mathbf{F Y I}_{[1]}-5: 3 \end{aligned}$ |
| 17:21, 17:24, 18:2, |  |  |  |  |
| 18:10, 22:8, 22:12, | 15:23 | Dignan [1] - 14:5 <br> director [1] - 20:7 <br> discuss [1] - 7:18 <br> discussed [3]-28:1, | exemptions [1] - |  |
| $25: 24,26: 17,26: 21$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Council }[5] \text { - 15:3, } \\ & 24: 5,24: 10,25: 10, \\ & 25: 12 \end{aligned}$ |  |  | $\mathbf{F Y I}_{[1]}-5: 3$ |
| 27:2, 27:11, 27:13 |  |  |  | G |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Commissioner [6] - } \\ & \text { 18:1, 18:3, 22:3, } \\ & 23: 16,26: 5,28: 10 \end{aligned}$ | Counsel [2]-1:18, 2:12 | $\begin{gathered} \text { 28:17, 29:1 } \\ \text { discussion [2] - } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 10:6, 27:18 } \\ \text { exterior }[1]-6: 3 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { garage }[4]-5: 19, \\ & 5: 20,5: 25,6: 4 \\ & \text { garages }[3]-8: 3,8: 4, \\ & \text { 10:18 } \\ & \text { general }[1]-19: 1 \end{aligned}$ |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { COUNTY }_{[1]}-30: 4 \\ & \text { couple }_{[1]}-26: 6 \end{aligned}$ | dispute [1]-27:19 | F |  |
|  | cover [1]-21:5 | district [1] - 19:15 |  |  |
|  | covers [1]-11:24 | done [1]-24:19 | ```faces [1] - 8:9 fact [1] - 25:6 familiar [2]-26:22, 27:3 fashion [1] - 16:23 favor [8]-3:7, 4:19, 7:2, 11:8, 12:9,``` | ```General [2] - 1:18, 2:12 glass [3] - 27:20,``` |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { commissioners [1] } \\ & 3: 21 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { criteria }[2]-13: 11, \\ & 22: 20 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |
| Committee [5] | critical ${ }_{[1]}-17: 4$ | [2]-6:4 |  | glass [3]-27:20, $27: 25,28: 8$ |
| 24:10, 24:15, 24:23, | crossed [1] - 20:16 | $\text { due }[1]-13: 25$ |  | Gotcha ${ }_{[1]}$ - 21:16 |
| 24:25, 25:16 |  | duplicate [1] - 14: |  | gotcha [2]-19:21, |
| common [2]-14:14, |  | during [1]-16:15 |  | 20:4 |





