



---

JACKSONVILLE POLICE AND FIRE PENSION FUND  
ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
MEETING SUMMARY – NOVEMBER 7, 2018 – 9:00AM

---

**PRESENT**

James Holderfield, Chair  
Lt. Michael Shell, Vice Chair  
Thomas Lumpkin  
Eng. Jean Paravisini  
Michael Pelletier  
Asst. Chief Richard Reichard  
Lt. Christopher Stover

**STAFF**

Timothy H. Johnson, Executive Director – Plan Administrator  
Steve Lundy, Assistant Plan Administrator  
Chuck Hayes, Pension Benefits Manager  
Lawsikia Hodges, Office of General Counsel

**EXCUSED**

Bob Sugarman, Fund Counsel – via Webex

**Meeting Convened**

9:01AM

**Meeting Adjourned**

9:50AM

NOTICE: Any person requiring a special accommodation to participate in the meeting because of disability shall contact Steve Lundy, Assistant Plan Administrator at (904) 255-7373, at least five business days in advance of the meeting to make appropriate arrangements. If any person decides to appeal any decision made with respect to any matter considered at this public meeting such person will need a record of proceedings, and for such purpose such person may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made at their own expense and that such record includes the testimony and evidence on which the appeal is based. The public meeting may be continued to a date, time, and place to be specified on the record at the meeting. Additional items may be added / changed prior to meeting.

---

**I. MOMENT OF SILENCE**

John E. Danson, Retired Police Director  
James C. Davis Sr., Retired Police Officer  
Odell Norris, Retired Firefighter

**II. PUBLIC SPEAKING PERIOD**

None.

**III. CONSENT AGENDA (ITEMS 1-7)**

***Motion to approve: SHELL; Second: REICHARD; APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.***

*The benefits listed below have been reviewed and approved by the Pension Benefits Manager.*

**1. MEETING SUMMARY TO BE APPROVED**

1. **Summary of the Meeting held October 10, 2018.**  
Copy held in the meeting file.

**2. APPLICATION FOR SURVIVOR BENEFITS**

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| 1. <b>IVEY, Carolyn T.</b><br>Monthly gross pension | Widow of Kenneth R. Ivey (d. 09/27/2018)<br>\$4,465.81 |
|---|--|

**3. APPLICATION FOR VESTED RETIREMENT**

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| 1. <b>BEECHLER, William J.</b><br>Monthly gross pension<br>Vesting Date 10/29/2018 | Police Officer<br>\$1,156.88<br>Benefit Commencement Date 12/21/2029 |
| 2. <b>LIBERTY, Charlene E.</b><br>Monthly gross pension<br>Vesting Date 10/26/2018 | Police Officer<br>\$1,627.44<br>Benefit Commencement Date 12/11/2026 |

**4. APPLICATION FOR TIME SERVICE CONNECTIONS**

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| 1. <b>ABELL, Scott H.</b><br>Florida Service (2 yrs., 9 mos.)                 | Firefighter Engineer<br>\$37,844.40             |
| 2. <b>JESTER, Brandon L.</b><br>Military Service (1 yrs.)                     | Police Officer<br>\$9,446.43                    |
| 3. <b>ELKINS, Jonathan R.</b><br>COJ Service (4 yrs., 11 mos., 27 days)       | Police Officer<br>\$22,869.88                   |
| 4. <b>GEORGE, Michael F.</b><br>Florida Service (9 mos., 4 days)              | Fire Lieutenant<br>\$11,650.48                  |
| 5. <b>GRIFFIN, Raphael D.</b><br>Military Service (2 yrs.)                    | Police Officer<br>\$18,892.85                   |
| 6. <b>SHELSEA, Robert S.</b><br>Military Service (2 yrs.)                     | Firefighter Engineer<br>\$18,811.20             |
| <del>7. <b>*SHUBERT III, Archie L.</b><br/>COJ Service (4 yrs., 2 mos.)</del> | <del>Firefighter Engineer<br/>\$10,176.98</del> |

**Application for Time Service Connections no. 7 deferred to December's Advisory Committee Consent Agenda.**

**5. SHARE PLAN DISTRIBUTIONS**

*To be received as information*

- |   |                                    |
|---|------------------------------------|
| 1. <b>AGNEW, Latosha M.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution      | Police Officer<br>\$3,167.76       |
| 2. <b>BORNTRAEGER, Edward B.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution | Police Officer<br>\$3,167.76       |
| 3. <b>BRENNAN, Paul J.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution       | Firefighter Engineer<br>\$3,167.76 |
| 4. <b>DANZIE, Terence L.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution     | Police Officer<br>\$3,167.76       |
| 5. <b>DUDLEY, Torin-Patrick</b><br>Share Plan Distribution  | Police Officer<br>\$3,167.76       |
| 6. <b>DUNN, Noelle B.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution        | Police Officer<br>\$3,167.76       |
| 7. <b>FACUNDUS, Susan M.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution     | Police Officer<br>\$3,167.76       |
| 8. <b>HENDRICKS, Clayburn B.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution | Fire Lieutenant<br>\$3,167.76      |
| 9. <b>JONES, Michael D.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution      | Police Officer<br>\$3,167.76       |
| 10. <b>KLINGBEIL, Gene A.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution    | Fire Captain<br>\$3,167.76         |
| 11. <b>KRUGER, Mark A.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution       | Fire Lieutenant<br>\$3,167.76      |
| 12. <b>McDONALD, Ruthie P.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution   | Police Officer<br>\$3,167.76       |
| 13. <b>TERRELL, Gary</b><br>Share Plan Distribution         | Fire Lieutenant<br>\$3,167.76      |
| 14. <b>THOMAS, David R.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution      | Firefighter Engineer<br>\$3,167.76 |
| 15. <b>WELSH, Tyrone A.</b><br>Share Plan Distribution      | Police Officer<br>\$3,167.76       |

**6. DROP PARTICIPANT TERMINATION OF EMPLOYMENT**

*To be received as information*

- |                                    |                         |
|------------------------------------|-------------------------|
| 1. <b>AYOUB, Claude E.</b>         | Police Lieutenant       |
| Monthly Pension Base               | \$4,559.44              |
| DROP Participation                 | 10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018 |
| 2. <b>BISHOP, Donald A.</b>        | Police Officer          |
| Monthly Pension Base               | \$3,170.34              |
| DROP Participation                 | 10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018 |
| 3. <b>BLACKWELL Jr., Edmund W.</b> | Firefighter Engineer    |
| Monthly Pension Base               | \$3,041.41              |
| DROP Participation                 | 10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018 |

***DROP Participant Termination of Employment no. 3 corrected job title to Firefighter Engineer.***

- |                                  |                         |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------|
| 4. <b>CARNEY, Randy M.</b>       | Fire Captain            |
| Monthly Pension Base             | \$4,292.20              |
| DROP Participation               | 04/12/2014 – 10/12/2018 |
| 5. <b>CARROLL, Robert G.</b>     | Fire Lieutenant         |
| Monthly Pension Base             | \$4,780.60              |
| DROP Participation               | 10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018 |
| 6. <b>DOUCETTE, David H.</b>     | Firefighter Engineer    |
| Monthly Pension Base             | \$3,022.39              |
| DROP Participation               | 10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018 |
| 7. <b>FUSSELL II, Robert W.</b>  | Fire Lieutenant         |
| Monthly Pension Base             | \$3,459.39              |
| DROP Participation               | 10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018 |
| 8. <b>HOOVER, John K.</b>        | Police Officer          |
| Monthly Pension Base             | \$3,626.76              |
| DROP Participation               | 10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018 |
| 9. <b>KVISTAD, John K.</b>       | Fire Captain            |
| Monthly Pension Base             | \$4,289.14              |
| DROP Participation               | 10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018 |
| 10. <b>MILBERGER, Jeffery C.</b> | Fire Lieutenant         |
| Monthly Pension Base             | \$3,745.41              |
| DROP Participation               | 04/12/2014 – 10/12/2018 |

POLICE AND FIRE PENSION FUND  
 ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
 MEETING SUMMARY – NOVEMBER 7, 2018  
 Page 5

|  |  |
|--|--|
| 11. <b>OGIN, Jack F.</b><br>Monthly Pension Base<br>DROP Participation       | Fire Lieutenant<br>\$4,564.93<br>10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018 |
| 12. <b>ROBERTS, Donald F.</b><br>Monthly Pension Base<br>DROP Participation  | Police Officer<br>\$3,163.53<br>10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018  |
| 13. <b>RUTKOWSKI, David T.</b><br>Monthly Pension Base<br>DROP Participation | Fire Captain<br>\$4,286.94<br>10/07/2017 – 10/05/2018    |
| 14. <b>SISAK, Charles D.</b><br>Monthly Pension Base<br>DROP Participation   | Police Officer<br>\$3,116.78<br>10/12/2013 – 10/05/2018  |

7. **DROP DISTRIBUTIONS**

*To be received as information*

|  |                             |
|--|-----------------------------|
| 1. <b>AYOUB, Claude E.</b><br>Entire value paid over 40 years                                  | \$353,819.60                |
| 2. <b>BISHOP, Donald A.</b><br>Entire value paid over 49.5 years                               | \$246,022.62                |
| 3. <b>BLACKWELL Jr., Edmund W.</b><br>Entire value paid over 30 years                          | \$236,018.77                |
| 4. <b>CARNEY, Randy M.</b><br>Entire value paid over 35 years                                  | \$296,822.44                |
| 5. <b>CARROLL, Robert G.</b><br>Entire value paid over 30 years                                | \$370,981.23                |
| 6. <b>DOUCETTE, David H.</b><br>Partial Lump Sum Payment<br>Remaining value paid over 30 years | \$60,000.00<br>\$174,542.15 |
| 7. <b>FUSSELL II, Robert W.</b><br>Entire value paid over 49.5 years                           | \$268,454.24                |
| 8. <b>HOOVER, John K.</b><br>Entire Lump Sum Payment   | \$281,442.03                |
| 9. <b>KVISTAD, John K.</b><br>Entire value paid over 35 years                                  | \$332,843.18                |

POLICE AND FIRE PENSION FUND  
ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
MEETING SUMMARY – NOVEMBER 7, 2018  
Page 6

|                                   |              |
|-----------------------------------|--------------|
| 10. <b>MILBERGER, Jeffery C.</b>  |              |
| Entire value paid over 45.5 years | \$259,009.99 |
| 11. <b>OGIN, Jack F.</b>          |              |
| Entire value paid over 46.5 years | \$354,245.67 |
| 12. <b>ROBERTS, Donald F.</b>     |              |
| Entire value paid over 25 years   | \$245,494.43 |
| 13. <b>RUTKOWSKI, David T.</b>    |              |
| Entire value paid over 5 years    | \$54,571.18  |
| 14. <b>SISAK, Charles D.</b>      |              |
| Entire value paid over 30 years   | \$241,866.60 |

**IV. OLD BUSINESS**

*None.*

**V. COUNSEL REPORTS**

*Lawsikia Hodges*

**1. Bailiff Time Service Connections (NO HANDOUT)**

*Lawsikia Hodges updated the Advisory Committee on the progress made on the Bailiff Time Service Connections issue. Bob Sugarman's office and OGC both agree that to connect time, members must meet the strict guideline set forth in OGC's legal memorandum – "In order for a Bailiff to prove that he or she was entitled to connect time, i.e., was previously a permanent (regular), full-time employee, the Bailiff would need to show, at a bare minimum, more than six consecutive months of working not less than 40 hours per week (or not less than 80 hours per two-week pay period)."*

*Lawsikia Hodges said the Board of Trustees asked for a letter to be drafted to send to members who applied to purchase bailiff time. Steve Lundy has drafted a letter to members, which would give members time to provide certification the PFPF needs to process their applications. If their applications are denied, they may appeal in accordance with the PFPF's Benefit Corrections & Appeal Policy.*

*Timothy Johnson said he had two conversations with JSO HR Chief, Larry Schmitt. He said that he wants to avoid undue burdens on members and the Advisory Committee. He said he asked Chief Schmitt to request an updated 'Legacy File' from the City, for the PFPF to analyze, and apply the legal standard set forth by OGC. Everyone must meet the same standard – we will get the Legacy File, do analysis internally, and then send the letters.*

*James Holderfield asked when the letters would be sent and how long members would have to respond.*

POLICE AND FIRE PENSION FUND  
ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
MEETING SUMMARY – NOVEMBER 7, 2018  
Page 7

*Timothy Johnson said the draft letter is in 'ping pong'. The PFPF drafted the letter, sent it to Lawsikia Hodges, then the PFPF met with Chief Schmitt and revised the latest draft, which Lawsikia Hodges has not yet seen. The PFPF's draft, and Lawsikia Hodges' draft will be integrated.*

*Steve Lundy said the letter would give members 30 days to respond with a certified application.*

*James Holderfield suggested denying the applications first, then sending the correspondence letter.*

*Thomas Lumpkin asked if there was case law or provisions dealing with similar legal issues.*

*Lawsikia Hodges discussed the one case decided by the PERC committee, which is binding in cases such as this.*

*James Holderfield said the onus should be placed on the member to provide data supporting his application.*

*Lawsikia Hodges indicated that would be the normal course of action, but this case is different. Our thought was that the PFPF should notify the member saying 'this is what we determine', prior to denying the application – so that if the member has other resources to better prove their case to connect time, we would give them 30 days, then the Advisory Committee would have the option to deny.*

*Lawsikia Hodges reiterated that this case is different – the reason why these members were allowed to apply early was to lock in their rate prior to the pension contribution increase, and prior to the collectively bargained raises. In the meantime, we had to figure out what information we needed from the member to administer their application. We haven't gotten back to these members asking them for the information we need yet. That is why we should not deny the applications yet.*

*James Holderfield agreed, and noted that the PFPF has gone way outside its scope and responsibilities. He said he would leave it up to the PFPF administration to send the letters to members and take up the issue again later.*

**2. Appeals Training – HANDOUT**

*Timothy Johnson passed out copies of the 'Procedures for Conducting Administrative Hearings on Appeals Affecting Substantial Interests' (HANDOUT) to the Advisory Committee, leading to the first item under the Executive Director's Report.*

**VI. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

*Timothy Johnson*

**1. Beaches Time Service Connections – Update**

*Timothy Johnson said that out of the 9 members affected, 8 members have appealed their Beaches Time Service Connections. The Advisory Committee needs a procedure to conduct the appeals.*

POLICE AND FIRE PENSION FUND  
ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
MEETING SUMMARY – NOVEMBER 7, 2018  
Page 8

*Pedro Herrera and Lawsikia Hodges put together these outstanding appeals procedures. Hopefully, the appeals will be resolved quickly. There are two options – hold sophisticated hearings where there is a designated, professional hearing officer hired, or secondly, the Advisory Committee would hear the appeals as the Board's designee. There is language related to a 'Presiding Officer' – that would be James Holderfield – he would officiate over the process.*

*Timothy Johnson said he anticipates the Advisory Committee would read and digest these procedures before accepting them. Appellants would be invited to a scheduled hearing once the Advisory Committee is comfortable.*

*James Holderfield said the document is comprehensive, detailed, and looks great. The Advisory Committee will have time to set rules prior to the hearing. We are getting closer to finally mitigating these errors.*

*Timothy Johnson said the Board wants to be fair, and not to create a long, expensive process.*

**2. Quarterly DROP Statements – Update**  
Steve Lundy

*Steve Lundy said that quarterly DROP Statements have resumed for all Phase I members of the DROP. Adjustments to all Phase II members of the DROP have been calculated and confirmed by the Fund Actuary, Pete Strong, and will be made on November 19<sup>th</sup>. Statements will resume for Phase II members of the DROP after the adjustments are made.*

*James Holderfield said members he has talked with are ecstatic that their statements are rolling back out again so quickly.*

**3. 2019 Calendar and FY2019 Priorities**

*James Holderfield said the meetings dates are fine for 2019.*

*Timothy Johnson asked for any feedback the Advisory Committee may have regarding the FY2019 Proposed Priorities. No action is needed. If any members have feedback, they should send us an email.*

*James Holderfield said retired members are excited about the online portal.*

*James Holderfield asked for an update on the non-compliant affidavits.*

*Chuck Hayes said he sent the affidavits to Timothy Johnson, who forwarded them to OGC. OGC is currently reviewing them.*



POLICE AND FIRE PENSION FUND  
ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
MEETING SUMMARY – NOVEMBER 7, 2018  
Page 9

**VII. NEW BUSINESS**

*None.*

---

Steve Lundy, Assistant Plan Administrator  
Posted 11/08/2018

---

James Holderfield, Chair  
To be approved at the Advisory Committee Meeting on December 12, 2018.

The next regular meeting will be held Wednesday, December 12, 2018 at 9:00AM.